

STUDIES

IN THE SPIRITUALITY OF JESUITS

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA AND THE HOLY
SPIRIT: FOUR STRATEGIES TO COPE WITH
THE PNEUMATOLOGICAL AMBIGUITY OF
EARLY IGNATIAN SOURCES

JOS MOONS, SJ

58/1

SPRING 2026

THE SEMINAR ON JESUIT SPIRITUALITY

STUDIES IN THE SPIRITUALITY OF JESUITS is a publication of the Jesuit Conference of Canada and the United States.

The Seminar on Jesuit Spirituality is composed of Jesuits appointed from their provinces. The seminar identifies and studies topics pertaining to the spiritual doctrine and practice of Jesuits, especially US and Canadian Jesuits, and gathers current scholarly studies pertaining to the history and ministries of Jesuits throughout the world. It then disseminates the results through this journal.

The opinions expressed in STUDIES are those of the individual authors. The subjects treated in STUDIES may be of interest also to Jesuits of other regions and to other religious, clergy, and laity. All who find this journal helpful are welcome to access previous issues at: <https://jesuitsourcesdigital.bc.edu/periodicals/ssj/>.

CURRENT MEMBERS OF THE SEMINAR

Note: Parentheses designate year of entry as a seminar member.

Casey C. Beaumier, SJ, is Haub Vice President for University Mission and Ministry at Boston College, Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts. (2016)

Michael L. Knox, SJ, is Vice Rector of the Regis Jesuit Community, Toronto, Ontario, and lecturer at Regis College, Toronto. (2016)

William McCormick, SJ, is a writer for *Civiltà Cattolica* and a contributing editor for *America* magazine. (2019)

John D. Meehan, SJ, is the director of the Bill Graham Centre for Contemporary International History at Trinity College and superior of the Canadian Martyrs Jesuit Community, Toronto. (2024)

Peter P. Nguyen, SJ, is associate professor of religious studies at the College of the Holy Cross. (2018)

**IGNATIUS AND THE HOLY SPIRIT:
FOUR STRATEGIES TO COPE WITH THE
PNEUMATOLOGICAL AMBIGUITY OF
EARLY IGNATIAN SOURCES**

JOS MOONS, SJ

STUDIES IN THE SPIRITUALITY OF JESUITS

58/1 • SPRING 2026

in the beginning . . .

Though it is almost twenty years ago that I sat for my comprehensive examination in theology at Regis College, University of Toronto, I remember well the moment when, having presented, to the best of my ability, the mission of God the Son, in loving relationship with God the Father, a professor asked me, somewhat sternly, “Well Michael, what about the Holy Spirit?” He then correctly cited Thomas Aquinas and Augustine on the matter, and hit the final blow, asking me to define passive “spiration.” Despite being frazzled by the question, I passed the exam, no doubt carried by the proceeding love of our Triune God.

As my old professor asked of me at that moment, so does Fr. Jos Moons (ELC) ask, in the present issue of *STUDIES*, “What about the Holy Spirit?” And as Fr. Moons develops his argument with reference to the primary sources, we see anew the seeming incongruity between the evident importance of the Spirit in the life of St. Ignatius and the conspicuous absence of reference to the Spirit in the *Exercises*. But by guiding the reader carefully through the traditional explanations for this lacuna, Fr. Moons brings us to both a new insight and a new pastoral response to the question.

In gratitude for this thought-provoking contribution, we look forward to receiving more of such to be put forward in future editions and, in the meantime, wish one and all every blessing in the summer ahead.

Michael L. Knox, SJ
General Editor

Breathe in me, O Holy Spirit,

That my thoughts may all be holy.

Act in me, O Holy Spirit,

That my work, too, may be holy.

Draw my heart, O Holy Spirit,

That I love but what is holy.

Strengthen me, O Holy Spirit,

To defend all that is holy.

Guard me, then, O Holy Spirit,

That I always may be holy.

—*“Holy Spirit Prayer of St. Augustine,” loyolapress.com*

1. What do I think about the Holy Spirit? What sort of things does the Spirit do? What images of the Holy Spirit help me in my prayer and reflection? How do I see the Holy Spirit along with the Father and the Son?
2. Fr. Moons takes a pneumatological approach to speaking about Ignatian spirituality in general and consolation in particular. How do I live Ignatian spirituality and what shape does consolation take in my faith life? And what role, small or large, does the Holy Spirit play in all this?
3. Fr. Moons encourages boldness in naming the Spirit when we present Ignatian spirituality. How do I talk about Ignatian spirituality? Would I wish to speak about the Spirit more than I do and, if so, how? And if not, how would I rather speak?

CONTENTS

**IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA AND THE HOLY SPIRIT: FOUR STRATEGIES
TO COPE WITH THE PNEUMATOLOGICAL AMBIGUITY OF EARLY
IGNATIAN SOURCES**

Jos MOONS, SJ..... 9

Introduction..... 9

1. Ignatius and the Holy Spirit..... 12

 A. The Holy Spirit in the *Constitutions*..... 13

 B. The Holy Spirit in the “Spiritual Diary” 16

 C. The Holy Spirit in the *Spiritual Exercises*..... 20

2. Ignoring the Issue 25

3. Explaining the Issue 30

4. Recognizing the Spirit as Implicitly Present..... 35

5. Why Bother? 40

6. Pastoral and Practical Considerations 43

Jos Moons (ELC) currently serves as an assistant professor on the theology faculty of Boston College. He holds both a canonical degree (STD) and a doctorate (PhD) from Tilburg University in the Netherlands and has published extensively on spiritual direction, the Holy Spirit, and synodality. His dissertation appeared as *The Holy Spirit, the Church, and Pneumatological Renewal: Mystici Corporis, Lumen Gentium and Beyond* (Brill 2022).

Ignatius of Loyola and the Holy Spirit: Four Strategies to Cope with the Pneumatological Ambiguity of Early Ignatian Sources¹

Jos Moons, SJ

Introduction

The Second Vatican Council's call for religious congregations and orders to renew their spirituality by revisiting their original charism has, as far as the Ignatian family is concerned, greatly benefitted from an impressive *ad fontes* movement that started in the late nineteenth century.² As John O'Malley (1927–2022) and Timothy O'Brien (UEA) describe in their article on the twentieth-century renewal—or, as they call it, “construction”—of Ignatian spirituality, the first publications of the multi-volume *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu* series mark the beginning point of that movement.³ Indeed, the publication of original source texts in the *Monumenta* has provided researchers

¹ This research began during my tertianship at Comillas in March 2022, and I continued it in Spring 2025 as the Cavalieri Chair Jesuit Professor at the Clough School of Theology and Ministry at Boston College. I thank the Canto Blanco and Faber Jesuit communities for their hospitality and the librarians for their help as well conversation partners Casey Beaumier (UMI), Cyrille Causse (EOF), Kenneth Hughes (UEA), Nikolaas Sintobin (ELC), Jan Stuyt (ELC), and the editors of *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits*.

² The guiding principles for the “adapted renewal” (*accommodata renovatio*) of religious life are “the founders’ spirit and special aims,” the tradition grown from it, and the actual (local) context, see *Perfectae Caritatis* (October 28, 1965), §2, https://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_decree_19651028_perfectae-caritatis_en.html. For background, see Maryanne Confoy, *Religious Life and Priesthood: Perfectae Caritatis, Optatam Totius, Presbyterorum Ordinis* (New York: Paulist Press, 2008).

³ John W. O'Malley and Timothy W. O'Brien, “The Twentieth-Century Construction of Ignatian Spirituality: A Sketch,” *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 52, no. 3 (Autumn 2020).

with a trove of resources and has led to a fundamentally renewed imagination of both Ignatius and the Jesuit Order.

For example, Ignatius's personal diary revealed a deeply spiritual man whose affective connection with God regularly brought him to tears. Was this really Ignatius, the cadaver-obedience general of the Jesuit order? Similar questions arose from an account of the early companions' *Deliberatio*, detailed descriptions of early Jesuit activities in the *Chronicon*, and instructions and letters from early Jesuits like Jerónimo Nadal and Francisco Javier.⁴ Delving into these sources also impacted scholars' imagination of the order. It turned out that a flexible creativity marked the Society of Jesus, which typically adapted personal gifts to local circumstances, placing it in marked contrast with moralistic, one-size-fits-all images of Jesuits as blindly obedient.⁵

Over time, the new perspectives trickled down from the narrow circle of scholars to the general membership of the Society and to practitioners of Ignatian spirituality. In his partially autobiographical "Will the Real Ignatius Please Stand Up?" Ron Darwen (1931–2015) powerfully captures this dramatic shift of impression from Ignatius, Man of Action—and the Jesuits as "something like a spiritual SAS"—to Ignatius, Man of Prayer and Mystical Master.⁶ In this vein, new spiritual forms, such as the personally guided retreat, now the most common mode for

⁴ As O'Malley and O'Brien put it, the *Chronicon* "contained sufficient data to destroy the reigning stereotype of a religious order marked by life under strict military discipline." See O'Malley and O'Brien, "The Twentieth-Century Construction of Ignatian Spirituality," 9.

⁵ As O'Malley and O'Brien note, "accommodation to circumstances forms another leitmotif both in Ignatius's correspondence and in the *Constitutions* concerning how Jesuits were to conduct themselves in their ministries." See O'Malley and O'Brien, "The Twentieth-Century Construction of Ignatian Spirituality," 38. For a general discussion of changes, see "VIII. The Elements of a Spiritual Culture," 29–39, with comments on obedience at 23–24.

⁶ Ron Darwen, "Will the Real Ignatius Please Stand Up?", *Thinking Faith* (July 30, 2008), https://www.thinkingfaith.org/articles/20080730_1.htm. See also David Lonsdale, *Eyes to See, Ears to Hear: An Introduction to Ignatian Spirituality* (London: DLT, 1990), "Images of Ignatius," 8–31. For sobering hermeneutical considerations, see Philip Endean, "Who Do You Say Ignatius Is?: Jesuit Fundamentalism and Beyond," *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 19, no. 5 (November 1987).

an Ignatian retreat, took shape.⁷ In this way, the “construction of Ignatian spirituality” went through various phases and lasted for the entire twentieth century—a process in which this very journal has played a key role. Indeed, we owe those involved in that renewal a great debt, as their efforts have led to more accurate and life-giving understandings of Ignatius, the Jesuits, and Ignatian spirituality.

At the same time, the study of these early sources has revealed certain ambiguities, especially as regards the place of the Holy Spirit in Christian life. On this point, in some of his writings, Ignatius names the Spirit explicitly and foregrounds the Spirit’s action.⁸ For example, Ignatius’s “Spiritual Diary,” largely unknown before its publication in the *Monumenta*, witnesses a deep affection for the Trinity in general and specifically for each of the divine persons.⁹ However, as scholars have remarked since the 1970s, almost no mention of the Holy Spirit appears in the *Spiritual Exercises*.

This article outlines four strategies for addressing this problem. In the first strategy, some writers simply ignore it, reading sources that do not mention the Holy Spirit as if they did. As for the second strategy, other writers explain the absence of Spirit-talk as an attempt Ignatius’s attempt to avoid charges of *alumbradismo*—affiliation with a suspect spiritual movement of the day. And in the third strategy, some commentators identify in these same writings the reality and operation of

⁷ O’Malley and O’Brien: “The Twentieth-Century Construction of Ignatian Spirituality,” 22–23; see also Darwen, “Will the Real Ignatius Please Stand Up?”

⁸ Ignatius’s secretary, Juan Alfonso de Polanco in fact played a major role in the formulation of some of his later writings, including the *Constitutions*. See J. Carlos Coupeau, “Juan de Polanco’s Role of as Secretary of Ignatius of Loyola: ‘His Memory and Hands,’” in *Ite inflammate omnia: Selected Historical Papers from Conferences Held at Loyola and Rome in 2006*, ed. Thomas M. McCoog (Rome: Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu, 2010), 109–27.

⁹ The trinitarian affection is commonly noted. For instance, Randy Sachs (UEA) noted: “Commentators like de Guibert, Haas, H. Rahner, Decloux, Knauer and Egan have pointed out how striking the trinitarian dimension of Ignatius’ mysticism is. From his *Autobiography* and *Spiritual diary*, we know that he received a number of extraordinary visions and illuminations of the Trinity,” John R. Sachs, “Ignatian Mysticism,” *The Way Supplement* 82 (1995): 73–83, at 74. For more discussion and references to the Diary itself, see section 1B of the present article.

the Spirit although the sources make no explicit mention of such. Note that each of these three strategies takes an intellectual approach to resolving the problem. A fourth strategy, by contrast, is more pastoral and especially well-suited to the work of spiritual directors. While maintaining respect for the text as written, it seeks concrete pneumatological renewal. How can the Spirit be thematized more explicitly?

In what follows, then, I propose three objectives: (1) to make key insights from Spanish-language materials available in English, (2) to distinguish, present, and evaluate the foregoing strategies, and (3) to develop the fourth strategy—what I have called the “pastoral approach,” as a complement to the three intellectual strategies. In all of this, I hope to highlight the Spirit’s central and life-giving role in the Ignatian worldview.

To this end, we will proceed by first considering, in part 1, the “pneumatological ambiguity” of the early sources before moving in parts 2–4 to examine the three “intellectual” strategies outlined above. Next, in part 5, we will consider why we bother at all problematizing Spirit language in the Ignatian corpus. Finally, we will conclude in part 6 with outlining a fourth, pastoral strategy.

1. Ignatius and the Holy Spirit

First, then, what about the “pneumatological ambiguity” of the early sources? By the term *ambiguity*, I acknowledge that, while some Ignatian sources highlight the role of the Holy Spirit, other Ignatian sources surprisingly do not. This contrast appears most clearly when comparing, on one hand, the *Constitutions* and the “Spiritual Diary” and, on the other hand, the *Spiritual Exercises*, while Ignatius’s letters and the “Autobiography” fit in both groups. Some examples drawn from the *Constitutions*, “Spiritual Diary,” and *Spiritual Exercises* will support this claim and provide context for the analysis of strategies in the following parts of this study.¹⁰

¹⁰ See also Bert Daelemans, “‘Unción del Espíritu Santo’ [Co 414]. Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades,” in *Dogmática Ignaciana: “Buscar y hallar la voluntad*

A. The Holy Spirit in the *Constitutions*

In the *Constitutions*, Ignatius balances human governance and guidelines with the Holy Spirit's direction as manifest in personal virtues.¹¹ The language is strong. While the Preamble leaves no doubt that Ignatius values the *Constitutions* as a means of human cooperation with God, he indicates clearly that the most helpful means of collaboration derives from the Spirit's interior working:

Although God our Creator and Lord is the one who in his Supreme Wisdom and Goodness must preserve, direct, and carry forward in his divine service this least Society of Jesus, just as he deigned to begin it; and although on our own part what helps most toward this end must be, more than any exterior constitution, the interior law of charity and love which the Holy Spirit writes and imprints upon hearts; nevertheless, since the gentle disposition of Divine Providence requires cooperation from his creatures, and since too the vicar of Christ our Lord has ordered this, and since the examples given by the saints and reason itself teach us so in our Lord, we think it necessary that constitutions should be written to aid us to proceed better, in conformity with our Institute, along the path of divine service on which we have entered.¹²

Ignatius goes on to support this general principle through specific constitutions that underscore the importance of the Spirit's leadership and "unction" as a complement to human leadership—for example, in the

divina" [Ej 1], ed. Gabino Uríbarri Bilbao (Madrid: Sal Terrae, 2018), 205–40.

¹¹ My reading of the *Constitutions* is mainly informed by *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, ed. George E. Ganss (St. Louis, MO: IJS, 1970); Antonio M. de Aldama, *An Introductory Commentary on the Constitutions*, 2nd ed. (Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1989), originally *Iniciación al Estudio de las Constituciones* (1979); and Manuel Ruiz Jurado, "El Espíritu Santo en las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús," *Manresa* 56 (1984): 219–28.

¹² *Constitutions* 134, hereafter *Const.*; *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and Their Complementary Norms: A Complete English Translation of the Official Latin Texts*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: The Institute of Jesuit Sources [IJS], 1996), 56. Note that Ignatius gives four arguments in favor of drafting constitutions: God's wish for human cooperation, the pope's order, the examples of the saints, and common sense. For commentary on this section, see Aldama, *An Introductory Commentary*, 66–71.

general comments at the end of the chapter on the formation of scholastics for mission.¹³ Here, he recalls that Jesuits should be formed in such a way that they can work with a variety of people in a range contexts, after which he reminds the reader that ultimately “this can be taught only by the unction of the Holy Spirit.”¹⁴ He goes on to state something very similar in relation to the superior’s decision-making about missioning people, that “although it is the supreme providence and direction of the Holy Spirit that must efficaciously bring us to make the right decision in all matters, and to send to each place those who are best fitted and suited to the people and task for which they are sent, still this much may be said in general.”¹⁵ Moreover, he affirms that God’s wisdom, which teaches the right “measure,” seems to have a pneumatological meaning, as well, given that “the measure to be observed in all things will be taught by holy unction of the Divine Wisdom [1 John 2:20, 27] to those who are charged with this matter, undertaken for his greater service and praise.”¹⁶

In addition, the Spirit’s interior law of charity and love, as introduced at the very beginning of the *Constitutions* in no. 134, echoes in the opening sections of the final part X, at nos. 812–13, even without the word *Spirit*. There, Ignatius praises “the means which unite the human instrument with God,” specifying various instances of “goodness and virtue, and especially charity, and a pure intention of the divine service, and familiarity with God our Lord in spiritual exercises of devotion, and sincere zeal for souls for the sake of the glory of the one who created and redeemed them and not for any other benefit.”¹⁷ The echoes of no. 134 sound loudly here.

¹³ *Const.* 400–14. See too n384 in *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus: A Critical Edition with the Complementary Norms*, ed. Barton T. Geger, transl. George E. Ganss (Boston: IJS, 2024), 212–3, in which Fr. Geger lists references to the Spirit and discusses the complementarity between human means and divine grace.

¹⁴ *Const.* 414; ed. Padberg, 170.

¹⁵ *Const.* 624; ed. Padberg, 288. Note the inclusion with the final sentence of *Const.* 624, this time featuring the Spirit’s “unction” (*Const.* 624, ed. Padberg, 290).

¹⁶ *Const.* 161; ed. Padberg, 78.

¹⁷ *Const.* 813; ed. Padberg, 400.

Admittedly, Ignatius does not distinguish the divine persons clearly among themselves. For example, the Preamble speaks of various actors without specifying which divine person they represent let alone how they relate to one another.¹⁸ Instead, he speaks of “[the] Supreme Wisdom and Goodness of God our Creator and Lord” that “must preserve, direct, and carry forward in his divine service this least Society of Jesus.”¹⁹ From a theological perspective, this statement raises questions about how these descriptions correspond and relate to the specific persons of the Trinity. For example, some sections suggest that this “Supreme Wisdom” represents a divine person with his own agency. For example, no. 136 speaks of “the help of him who as the Most Perfect and Infinite Wisdom is the beginning of all order.”²⁰ To which divine person does this wisdom refer? Likewise, in no. 134, wisdom relates to “God our Creator and Lord,” but Ignatius does not indicate to which divine person he refers.²¹

In the *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*, Luis Ladaria indicates that for Ignatius, the term *Creator*, with a capital, means both God in general and Christ, even though the act of creation generally relates to God the Father.²² Likewise, no. 161 connects wisdom to the Spirit, speaking of “the holy unction of the Divine Wisdom.”²³ Yet in the oath formulated in no. 705 — “I call upon Jesus Christ, Eternal Wisdom” — wisdom relates Christ.²⁴ In short, the interpretations vary.

Further questions arise in no. 134, where Ignatius speaks of “the Supreme Wisdom,” “God our Creator and Lord,” the Holy Spirit who “writes and imprints upon [people’s] hearts,” and finally that “Divine

¹⁸ *Const.* 134; ed. Padberg, 56.

¹⁹ *Const.* 134; ed. Padberg, 56.

²⁰ *Const.* 136; ed. Padberg, 58.

²¹ *Const.* 134; ed. Padberg, 56.

²² For examples of both types of references in Ignatius, see Luis Ladaria, “Creador,” in *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*, ed. José García de Castro, 2 vols. (Bilbao: Mensajero; Santander: Sal Terrae, 2007), 1:497–504.

²³ *Const.* 161; ed. Padberg, 78.

²⁴ *Const.* 705; ed. Padberg, 340.

Providence” which requires human cooperation.²⁵ Here again, only the term *Holy Spirit* seems clearly defined, while “Wisdom” and “God, Creator and Lord” may refer to Christ, the Holy Spirit, or the Triune Godhead. Note too that the final divine agent mentioned, “Divine Providence,” again has no clear reference to the Father, Son, or Spirit.

Other constitutions and primary source material further support the idea that Ignatius offers less clarity than a systematic theologian might like. Here, we might remember, as Jesuit General Pedro Arrupe (1907–1991) put it, that “Ignatius is not a professional theologian, and we must bear this in mind when reading his Journal, which in no way pretends to give a doctrinal illumination of the mystery of the Trinity.”²⁶ Nevertheless, for the sake of the present argument, we can affirm that Ignatius affirms, in certain places, the central importance of the Holy Spirit.

B. The Holy Spirit in the “Spiritual Diary”

While the “Spiritual Diary” supports this idea of the importance of the Holy Spirit to Ignatius, the text presents its own challenges, as Joseph Munitiz (1931–2022) and Philip Endean (1954–2023) explain:

One might have expected it to provide immediate access to his mind and spirituality. Instead many readers, even those who have some acquaintance with the life and work of Ignatius, find that the “Diary” remains a remote and impenetrable work. This is due partly to the style—elliptic and idiosyncratic,

²⁵ *Const.* 134; ed. Padberg, 56.

²⁶ Arrupe makes this comment in the context of a reflection on the “Spiritual Diary.” He goes nonetheless on to praise Ignatius as a good student possessing a prestigious degree. I would rather stress the first phrase, viz., that Ignatius had the gift not of theological clarity but of spiritual and practical wisdom. See Pedro Arrupe, “The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism,” *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 33, no. 3 (May 2001): 16–17. The article, an address from February 8, 1980, first appeared as “Inspiración trinitaria del carisma ignaciano,” *Acta Romana Societatis Iesu* XVIII/I – anno 1980 (1981), 67–114. See also Hugo Rahner’s chapter on “Ignatius der Theologe,” in *Ignatius von Loyola als Mensch und Theologe* (Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1964), 214–34, where Rahner outlines Ignatius as a spiritual soul as much as a theological mind.

and partly to the content—mystical experiences to which few people have access.²⁷

With this in mind, we need to understand the “Diary,” or that part of it that we have today, in the context of Ignatius’s task of writing constitutions, specifically his reflection on the vow of poverty. After Ignatius has made up his mind that the vow should hold strictly, he seeks God’s confirmation of that conviction by observing the state of his soul before, during, and after Mass as well as during the day. A typical entry specifies the day and the Mass celebrated and offers some comments about his state of mind. From this perspective, then, as Munitiz and Endean put it, the “Diary” represents a “Discernment Logbook” rather than a comprehensive record of his daily life, experiences, and thoughts.²⁸

For example, the person of the Blessed Virgin Mary plays a major role in the first entries of the “Diary.” Ignatius relates that he celebrates votive masses in her honor with the objective that she intercede for him with God. He notes, for the fourth day:

Mass of Our Lady

4th. Tuesday – Great devotion before, during and after mass, with tears so abundant that my eyes ached; I saw the Mother and Son ready and willing to intercede with the Father; both then and during the day I was set on poverty and still more moved to it; in the afternoon it was as if I felt or saw that Our Lady was ready and willing to intercede.²⁹

As his discernment continues, Ignatius celebrates, a couple days on, the votive Mass of the Trinity; then, some days later, in an apparent conclusion of his discernment, he celebrates the votive Mass of the Holy

²⁷ Joseph A. Munitiz and Philip Endean, “Introduction,” *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings* (London: Penguin, 1996), trans. Joseph A. Munitiz and Philip Endean, 67–69, at 67. For a more detailed commentary on the specific entries and their development, see Terence O’Reilly, “The Spiritual Exercises and the *Diario espiritual* of St. Ignatius,” in Terence O’Reilly, *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Contexts, Sources, Reception* (Leiden/Boston: Brill 2020), 277–96.

²⁸ Munitiz and Endean, “Introduction,” 69. The authors call this “a descriptive title.”

²⁹ *Diary*, entry for Feb. 5, 1544; *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings*, trans. Munitiz and Endean, 73–74.

Spirit.³⁰ However, sensing that he has made a mistake in his discernment, he restarts the process, as evident in a crossed-out text explaining that he feels tempted to allow for some income and feels disturbed by noises during Mass, which prompts him to investigate the origin of the noises.³¹ He then begins a new cycle of votive masses, beginning with a Marian Mass that he follows by thirteen masses to the Trinity and some other masses, concluding with a Mass to the Holy Spirit.³²

Importantly, these notes were meant for himself and not for publication—even though that has happened in the end. Logically, therefore, the formulations are terse, without any stylistic refinement, and, more importantly, without the explanation a reader would need to fully get what is going on. Yet that very same fact makes this a particularly useful resource to discover what the Holy Spirit meant to Ignatius.

Evidence to this point appears clearly in the entry for February 11.³³ Before Mass, Ignatius speaks confidently with the Holy Spirit in a “colloquy,” which results in various spiritual experiences.³⁴ Of these, in addition to experiencing “devotion and tears,” Ignatius relates that he “seemed to see or feel Him in a dense clarity or in the color of burning flame,” which he describes as “quite strange to me.”³⁵ These

³⁰ The Mass for the Trinity is on day 6, Feb. 7, and the Mass for the Holy Spirit is on day 10, Feb. 11, after which another Mass for the Trinity, on day 11, Feb. 12, seems to mark the stated end of his discernment.

³¹ *Diary*; trans. Munitiz and Endean, footnote 6 (linked with day 11, Feb. 12), 378. See also O'Reilly, “The Spiritual Exercises and the *Diario espiritual* of St. Ignatius,” 281. Ultimately, an unfreedom in seeking confirmation through signs seems to drive Ignatius's unrest. For support of this interpretation, see his confession on day 30, March 12: “At last I considered if I should proceed further. . . . I seemed to be wanting too many signs, and wanting them during certain periods or during masses ending in my own satisfaction; the question itself was clear; I was looking not for more certainty, but for a finishing touch that would be to my taste” (*Diary*; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 98). See also his later reflection on “the Tempter” trying to instill doubt (*Diary*; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 99).

³² This cycle lasts from day 12 to 30, Feb. 13–Mar. 2, with the Mass to the Holy Spirit on day 30.

³³ *Diary*, Feb. 11, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 75–76.

³⁴ For the colloquy, see *SpEx* 53–54.

³⁵ *Diary*, Feb. 11, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 75.

experiences in turn help him in the discernment process, as he explains that “all [the above] confirmed me in my election.”³⁶ Following this, he engages in a reflection, which provides insight and tears, after which it seems that the Spirit strengthens the confirmation: “A little later, just before going out to say mass, while I prayed for a short while, I felt intense devotion and wept on feeling or seeing in some way the Holy Spirit—the question of the election being now answered—and I could neither see nor feel either of the other two Divine Persons in this way.”³⁷

Here again we see that, as in the *Constitutions*, the “Diary” presents a theologically inconclusive conception of God. And to complicate matters further, his attention to Mary as expressed in the opening sections comes very close to the type of devotion reserved for God. Here, he speaks of an “increased trust in our Lady” and of “drawing-near in affection to Our Lady with great confidence.”³⁸ In fact, Mary sometimes joins the Son in a way that would seem more appropriate for the Spirit, as when Ignatius writes, “I saw the Mother and Son ready and willing to intercede with the Father.”³⁹ To this same point, he seems to indicate, on the day of the Mass to the Holy Spirit, not three but four divine agents: “I prayed to Our Lady, then to the Son, and to the Father that He might give me his Spirit to assist me in my reasonings and to give me clarity of mind.”⁴⁰ But again, as in our analysis of the *Constitutions*, it suffices here to indicate the importance that Ignatius accords to the Holy Spirit in the “Diary.”

³⁶ *Diary*, Feb. 11, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 75.

³⁷ *Diary*, Feb. 11, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 76.

³⁸ *Diary*, Feb. 2–4, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 73.

³⁹ *Diary*, Feb. 5, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 73–74. See also “the two mediators” on Feb. 7 and 8.

⁴⁰ *Diary*, Feb. 11, 1544; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 75. My own commentary resonates with Víctor Codina’s question on the triple colloquy in Víctor Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa: El Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios* (Barcelona: Cristianisme i justícia, 2011), 6, republished in *Apuntes ignacianos* 73 (2015): 48–79.

C. The Holy Spirit in the *Spiritual Exercises*

Given that the *Constitutions* and the “Spiritual Diary” leave no doubt about the Holy Spirit’s importance to Ignatius, we might expect that the *Spiritual Exercises*, his formalized retreat notes, would do the same. However, as commonly known, the *Exercises* surprisingly make almost no mention of the Third Person of the Trinity. As for the specific instances, he mentions the Spirit five times in a section listing Bible texts to pray from. In *SpEx* 263, he describes Elizabeth as “full of the Holy Spirit” when she greeted Mary, who had come to visit her. Likewise, in the account of Jesus’s baptism, Ignatius recalls that “the Holy Spirit came.”⁴¹ Then, in his account of what he calls “the sixth appearance,” Ignatius notes that Christ “gives them the Holy Spirit, saying: ‘Receive the Holy Spirit: whose sins you forgive, they will be forgiven them.’”⁴² And in *SpEx* 307, Ignatius reminds us of Christ’s commission to the disciples, which includes the mission to baptize in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit. This section ends with Christ’s ascension and Jesus’s command that the apostles should “wait in Jerusalem for the Holy Spirit that had been promised.”⁴³

Two more references appear in *SpEx* 352–70, which discuss right attitudes within the church. Here, Ignatius famously instructs, with reference to the Spirit, that if church leadership declares black what one sees as white, then one should believe it black: “for we believe that between Christ Our Lord, the bridegroom, and the Church, His bride, there is the same Spirit who governs and directs us for the good of our souls because it is by that same Spirit and Lord of us all who gave the Ten Commandments that our holy mother Church is directed and governed.”⁴⁴

Now, the fact that Ignatius refers to the Holy Spirit explicitly in these seven instances provokes the question as to why he does not reference the Spirit in other, similar contexts. To take these examples in

⁴¹ *SpEx* 263; *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings*; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 334.

⁴² *SpEx* 304; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 346.

⁴³ *SpEx* 397; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 347.

⁴⁴ *SpEx* 312; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 348.

order, we begin with *SpEx* 15, where Ignatius admonishes directors to take a modest posture with retreatants because God—whom Ignatius mentions in general and without reference to the Holy Spirit—guides the retreatant. Compare this to his near-contemporary John of the Cross, who extols the Spirit’s presence and operation in the soul, praising at length the “most hidden unction of the Holy Spirit” with which the Spirit guides the soul to contemplation.⁴⁵ In this vein, John goes on to note that, unfortunately, poorly formed and un-spiritual directors know nothing of the Spirit’s guidance and thus guide souls badly. Here, he regrets especially that such directors do not understand that “they themselves are not the chief agent, guide, and mover of souls in this matter, but the principal guide is the Holy Spirit, who is never neglectful of souls.”⁴⁶

In the second instance, Ignatius invites retreatants to end repetition-type meditations with a “triple colloquy” by which the retreatant asks Mary for the graces of insight and mending one’s life and so too of the Son and the Father.⁴⁷ In light of our foregoing analysis, it seems astonishing that a tripartite structure of this kind includes reference to Mary but not to the Holy Spirit.

Absence of reference to the Spirit stands out, too, in the meditation where God surveys the world and its sin and decides to become enter the world by incarnation rather than destroy it. Here, while Ignatius speaks explicitly and repeatedly of “the three divine persons” and what “they” are thinking, deciding, and doing, he never explicates God’s trin-

⁴⁵ *SpEx* 365; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 358.

⁴⁶ John of the Cross, *The Living Flame of Love*, stanza 3, no. 40–47, in *The Collected Works of Saint John of the Cross*, ed. Kieran Kavanaugh and Otilio Rodriguez, rev. ed. (Washington, DC: Institute of Carmelite Studies Publications, 1991), 689–92. See also Kevin Culligan, “Traditions of Spiritual Guidance: St. John of the Cross,” *The Way* 33, no. 1 (1993): 63–74.

⁴⁷ *SpEx* 62–63 and repeated in 64; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 297–98. Elsewhere, Ignatius presents a timetable for the various types of daily meditation (*SpEx* 75, 119, 159, 204, 227), and explicit references to the same kind of triple colloquy (*SpEx* 147, 148, 156, 164, 199).

ity and mentions by name only the “eternal Word” and Mary, referring to the First Person indirectly by counseling the prayer Our Father.⁴⁸

In the fourth case, it seems remarkable that the he does not mention the Holy Spirit in either in the Contemplation to Attain Love or the Rules for Discernment.⁴⁹ The Contemplation consists in a series of exercises—or contemplations, in the plural—that aim to provoke gratitude for God’s sustaining power. Through these exercises, Ignatius intends that greater interior knowledge of God would lead retreatants to gratitude for God’s generous gifts and gracious work on their behalf and, ultimately, to the retreatants making a self-offering to God. From this perspective, it seems that Ignatius easily could have connected the Spirit to God’s sustaining power and to the retreatant’s inner knowledge, gratitude, and gift of self. In like manner, the references in the Rules to gentleness, inner peace, dedication, and zeal also suggest the Spirit’s involvement.

Finally, in the section where Ignatius offers Bible passages for directors to use in working with retreatants, he could have referenced the work of the Spirit more. For example, his account of the Annunciation only mentions the angel, not the Holy Spirit.⁵⁰ Similarly, no mention of the Spirit appears in his account of Simeon greeting Jesus at the presentation in the temple or of the temptation of Jesus.⁵¹ In contrast, note that in all three cases Scripture refers to the Spirit.⁵² Moreover, Ignatius’s series of biblical texts ends with the Ascension and promise

⁴⁸ *SpEx* 101–109; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 305–6.

⁴⁹ *SpEx* 230–37 and 313–36; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 329–30 and 348–53.

⁵⁰ *SpEx* 262; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 334.

⁵¹ *SpEx* 268 and 274; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 335–6 and 337.

⁵² For the Annunciation, see Lk 1:34–35: “Mary said to the angel, ‘How can this be, since I am a virgin?’ The angel said to her, ‘The Holy Spirit will come upon you, and the power of the Most High will overshadow you; therefore the child to be born will be holy; he will be called Son of God.’” For Simeon, see Lk 2:26–27: “It had been revealed to him by the Holy Spirit that he would not see death before he had seen the Lord’s Messiah. Guided by the Spirit, Simeon came into the temple.” For the desert, both Lk 4:1 and Mt 4:1 speak about the Holy Spirit, with a double reference in Luke: “Jesus, full of the Holy Spirit, returned from the Jordan and was led by the Spirit in the wilderness, where for forty days he was tested by the devil.” Unless otherwise noted, all Scripture quotations come from the NRSVUE.

of the Holy Spirit, such that he makes no mention of the coming of the Spirit at Pentecost.⁵³

In sum, while the *Spiritual Exercises* do reference the Holy Spirit, they do so sparsely, and they do not reference the Spirit at places where we reasonably could expect that they would do so. This leaves us with the problem that, while some early Ignatian sources suggest that the Holy Spirit plays a key role in Ignatius's spirituality and thinking, others show quite the opposite. Santiago Arzubialde (ESP) qualifies this pneumatological ambiguity as "a fundamental dichotomy between his personal trinitarian experience, as manifested for example in the 'Spiritual Diary,' and the supposed christomonism of the *Spiritual Exercises*."⁵⁴

Before we move to discuss how authors deal with this limited pneumatology, it may help to review the recent history of commentary on this problem. As far back as in 1976, the American Jesuit Harvey Egan (UEA) wrote that "the almost total lack of explicit references to the Holy Spirit during the *Exercises* is most unusual and striking."⁵⁵ Four years later, the Spanish Jesuit José María Lera (ESP) admitted that "in the book of the *Exercises*, the Holy Spirit turns out to be mentioned explicitly

⁵³ As Baumert states beautifully, "el arco de los misterios salvíficos se cierra con la Ascensión. Pentecostés parece quedar fuera de consideración," Norbert Baumert, "El Espíritu Santo, aliento de toda vida nueva: pneumatología de los Ejercicios," in *Ejercicios espirituales y mundo de hoy. Congreso Internacional de Ejercicios, Loyóla, 20–26 septiembre de 1991*, ed. Juan Manuel García-Lomas (Bilbao: Mensajero, 2006), 197–206 at 197. Interestingly, Lera comments that in his *Directorium*, Polanco added Pentecost; see José María Lera Monreal (ESP), "La contemplación para alcanzar amor, el pentecostés de los Ejercicios," in *Manresa* 63 (1991): 163–90 at 166; *MHSI Exercitia*, vol. 2, 322: "Hoc Exercitium ad amorem excitandum proponi poterit postquam unum vel alterum diem, qui exercetur, in misteriis Resurrectionis (sub Resurrectione autem, Ascensionis et Pentecostes etiam misteria intellegere) versatur erit."

⁵⁴ Santiago Arzubialde, "Discernimiento – Unción del Espíritu – y Discretio. Presencia y actividad del Espíritu en los escritos de san Ignacio de Loyola," *Manresa* 70 (1998): 231–67 at 232. Juan Manuel Martín-Moreno speaks of a "contrast" in Juan Manuel Martín-Moreno, "El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales," *Manresa* 59 (1987): 357–72 at 357.

⁵⁵ Harvey D. Egan, *The Spiritual Exercises and the Ignatian Mystical Horizon* (St. Louis, MO: IJS, 1976), 120. With this statement, Fr. Egan opened his discussion on Ignatian mysticism and the Holy Spirit.

in very few instances.”⁵⁶ This acknowledgment progressed to the point that, by the end of the twentieth century, the received scholarly opinion recognized in the Ignatian corpus a limited pneumatology, and that opinion continues today, especially in Spanish language literature.⁵⁷ For example, in 2011, the Spanish Jesuit and expert in pneumatology Víctor Codina (1931–2023) remarked:

A critical look at the text of the *Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola* alerts us to the absence of references to the Holy Spirit throughout the book. This is very striking. Apart from a few quotations from the Gospels in which the Spirit is expressly mentioned in the Mysteries of the life of Christ (*SpEx* 261–312), the Spirit is mentioned only once in the whole book, and that is precisely in the Rules for *Sentire in Ecclesia* (*SpEx* 365). This pneumatological silence of Ignatius is all the more strange as references to the Holy Spirit are very abundant in the *Constitutions*, the “Spiritual Diary,” and the “Autobiography.”⁵⁸

Writers often follow their commentary of this kind with explanation for the paucity in Spirit-references, comments about the Spirit’s implied presence, or both. For example, in his 1991 reflection on Ignatian pneumatology, the German Jesuit and Scripture scholar Norbert Baumert (1932–2019) did both: “While Ignatius mentions the Spirit abun-

⁵⁶ José María Lera Monreal, “Apuntes para una pneumatología de los Ejercicios. En el XVI centenario del Concilio I de Constantinopla,” *Manresa* 53 (1981): 327–58 at 334, with similar formulations at 328 and 331. In 2016, Fr. Lera republished this article with minor changes and more materials as José María Lera Monreal, *La pneumatología de los Ejercicios espirituales: una teología de la cruz traducida a la vida* (Bilbao: Mensajero, 2016).

⁵⁷ In 1998, Manuel Ruiz noted that “algunos conocedores de los Ejercicios de san Ignacio han observado una ausencia significativa en ellos de menciones explícitas del Espíritu Santo”; see Manuel Ruiz Jurado, “El Espíritu Santo en la espiritualidad ignaciana,” *Manresa* 70 (1998): 217–23 at 217.

⁵⁸ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 3. It seems that over time Fr. Codina has grown in his awareness of the seriousness of the issue, since in an earlier article, after observing that “las citas explícitas del Espíritu Santo son escasas en los Ejercicios,” he immediately “solved” the issue: “pero en realidad es toda la obra de salvación, de purificación, de conocimiento de Cristo, de consolación, de elección, de paz, la que es fruto del Espíritu. Pentecostés no es un misterio que se contempla objetivamente fuera de nosotros, sino un misterio que se vive en la Iglesia presente y en cada cristiano. Toda la obra de los Ejercicios es una mistagogia del Espíritu”; see Víctor Codina, “Claves para una hermenéutica de los Ejercicios,” in *Manresa* 48 (1976): 51–72 at 68–69.

dantly in his other writings, in his own formulations of the book of the *Exercises* perhaps he has consciously omitted mention of it so as not to be misunderstood; but there are many names under which the Spirit hides himself.”⁵⁹ In parts 2–5 below, I provide an overview of these and other strategies to address the pneumatological ambiguity of early Ignatian sources.

2. Ignoring the Issue

A first category of approach ignores the issue. Here, commentators typically offer a trinitarian and/or pneumatological interpretation without indicating that they have imported this interpretive framework (and perhaps without admitting that an Ignatian source contains little reference to the Holy Spirit).

Maybe the best-known example of this sort appears in Fr. Arrupe’s 1980 address on “The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism.”⁶⁰ In a foreword to the English publication, the American Jesuit John Padberg (1926–2021) hails the address as “one of the last and most important of all of Fr. Arrupe’s writings.”⁶¹ As Arrupe himself indicates, readers should understand the address in the context of the Second Vatican Council’s invitation to religious orders and congregations to rediscover their original charism.⁶² Fr. Arrupe highlights Ignatius’s “Trinitarian inner life (*su intimidad trinitaria*)” as the origin from which the Ignatian spirit flows such that, without it, we would not be able to grasp that charism.⁶³ On this point, he writes that “only in the light of Ignatius’s Trinitarian intimacy (*intimidad trinitaria*) can we Jesuits understand, ac-

⁵⁹ Baumert, “El Espíritu Santo, aliento de toda vida nueva,” 199.

⁶⁰ Arrupe, “The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism,” full reference in footnote 26.

⁶¹ John W. Padberg, “Foreword: The Legacy of Father Arrupe,” in *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 33, no. 3 (May 2001), vii–viii at vii. He also qualifies this address as “the longest, the most wide-ranging, and the most profound” of five legacy texts, at viii.

⁶² Arrupe, “The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism,” no. 1, page 1–2.

⁶³ Arrupe, “The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism,” no. 2, page 2. The Spanish comes from Arrupe, “Inspiración trinitaria del carisma ignaciano,” 195.

cept, and live the Society's charism," for we too should draw our inspiration and orientation from that intimacy.⁶⁴

He goes on to elaborate on the trinitarian depth of Ignatius's spiritual experiences by delving into what he considers the three most important of them—namely, those at the Cardoner River, those in chapel at La Storta, and those that Ignatius describes in the "Spiritual Diary." Unfortunately, Arrupe seems to overlook that, in these three instances, Ignatius rarely mentions the Holy Spirit. For instance, in describing his Cardoner experience, Ignatius only speaks about the Trinity in general and without singling out the Holy Spirit—or indeed any divine person. It seems therefore too generous to qualify Cardoner as "a sort of Pentecost that marks an end of his past and kindles the light of a different future."⁶⁵

So too, regarding the La Storta experience, Ignatius specifies the Father and the Son but not the Holy Spirit. He even mentions Mary, to whom he had prayed "to place him with her Son," as he put it in the "Autobiography."⁶⁶ And subsequently, when his prayer is granted, Ignatius identifies the Father as the origin of that grace: "he saw so clearly that God the Father was placing him with Christ his Son."⁶⁷ Thus, although the text suggests a binitarian, not a trinitarian spirituality, Arrupe transforms it into a trinitarian experience by linking La Storta to Nadal's famous but textually-unwarranted description of Ignatius following the Spirit without going ahead of the Spirit.⁶⁸

⁶⁴ Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 4, page 3. Earlier in the same section he had stated: "I believe that neither the Society's way of proceeding nor its radical charism can be adequately understood and appreciated unless we mount up to the very top, to the Trinity" (Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 4, page 3).

⁶⁵ Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 11, page 6.

⁶⁶ Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 38, page 18.

⁶⁷ Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 39, page 18. In no. 39, Arrupe states, with reference to the "Autobiography" (no. 96): "Ignatius, with Laínez and Favre, entered the village 'and making a prayer [Ignatius] felt such a change coming over his soul and saw so clearly that God the Father was placing him with Christ his Son.'"

⁶⁸ Arrupe, "The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism," no. 43, page 20–21. In addition, the reference to Nadal is anachronistic, since Nadal speaks about Ignatius during his time in Paris while Arrupe speaks about the time he had almost

Finally, Fr. Arrupe explores the “Spiritual Diary” where, as noted above, Ignatius mentions both the Trinity in general and the Holy Spirit in particular. However, Ignatius’s presentation raises serious questions, especially related to the Holy Spirit’s late appearance and the role of Mary.

And so, while Fr. Arrupe’s essay presents a trinitarian account of Ignatian spirituality, he does not indicate that the accounts from the Cardoner and La Storta do not mention the Spirit, and neither does he address the theological issues with the accounts of La Storta and the “Diary.”⁶⁹ For this reason, to speak convincingly about a trinitarian inspiration in the Ignatian corpus demands more intentional reflection—all the more so since the Ignatian charism connects so directly with the *Spiritual Exercises* that make so little reference to the Spirit. I thus agree with Fr. Lera’s respectfully formulated criticism of Arrupe’s address, that “we would have to elaborate much more on the action of the Holy Spirit in the dynamic of the *Exercises*. Only in that way would we be able to speak about a trinitarian inspiration, and not merely a christological one, in what is most generally known of the Ignatian charism, the *Spiritual Exercises*.”⁷⁰

A second example of approaches that ignore the problem appears in the acclaimed commentary on the Rules for Discernment that Jules

arrived in Rome: “Quo tempore Lutetiae fuit, non solum studia literarum sectatus est, sed animum simul intendit quo spiritus illum ac divina vocatio ducebat, ad Ordinem religiosum instituendum; tametsi singulari animi modestia ducentem spiritum sequebatur, non praeibat. Itaque deducebatur” (see “Dialogi pro Societate contra haereticos,” in *MHSI, Font. narr.*, vol. 2, 252).

⁶⁹ For similarly optimistic readings, see Rogelio Carda Mateo, “Ignacio de Loyola: mística trinitaria,” *Miscelánea Comillas* 57 (1999): 421–68, and John O’Donnell, “Trinidad,” in *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*, 1720–8.

⁷⁰ Lera Monreal, *La pneumatología de los Ejercicios espirituales*, 18–19, elaborated at 29–31. The Spanish text reads: “el tema que el padre Arrupe exponía rotundamente no era tan evidente en lo que a los *Ejercicios Espirituales* se refería. . . . Había que profundizar mucho más en la acción del Espíritu Santo . . . en la dinámica de esos *Ejercicios*. Solo así se podría hablar de inspiración trinitaria y no solo cristológica en lo más comúnmente conocido del carisma ignaciano, como son sus *Ejercicios Espirituales*,” (19). Lera also uses the word “binitarian.”

Toner wrote (1914–1999).⁷¹ Fr. Toner frames discernment as the Christian endeavor of living according to the inspirations of the Holy Spirit, which we need to distinguish from impulses that stem from ourselves, our environment, or the devil. On this point, the very first line of his commentary testifies to Toner’s pneumatological agenda: “The working of the Holy Spirit within the individual Christian consciousness is the focus of this book. Human life is Christian life in the measure that it is lived under the inspiration of the Holy Spirit of Christ.”⁷² As such, Toner understands the Rules outlined by Ignatius as eminently pneumatological in that they contain Ignatius’s “wisdom about how to distinguish inner movements of the Holy Spirit from those that come from any other source, and about ways of maintaining openness to the Holy Spirit at all times.”⁷³ In this vein, he admits in a brief note that, despite the “puzzling fact,” as Fr. Egan puts it, that the *Spiritual Exercises* rarely mention the Holy Spirit, he has no problem with a pneumatological reading of Ignatius: “Nowadays we often speak of the Holy Spirit in many contexts where Ignatius speaks of God or a good angel; but it seems clear that in these instances we are still following his mind.”⁷⁴

And so, Fr. Toner does not seem to accord much weight to the fact that Ignatius himself did not speak much of the Spirit and instead simply posits that a pneumatological interpretation of the Rules follows the mind of Ignatius. Consistent with that conviction, Toner comments, for example, on the place in the *Exercises* where Ignatius describes consolation as an increase in love for God “our Creator and Lord,” by stating that “Ignatius immediately calls attention to the greatest work of the Holy Spirit in man’s spirit, that to which all other works of the Holy Spirit lead or from which they flow, charity.”⁷⁵

⁷¹ Jules J. Toner, *A Commentary on Saint Ignatius’ Rules for the Discernment of Spirits: A Guide to the Principles and Practice* (St. Louis, MO: IJS, 1981).

⁷² Toner, *A Commentary*, 1. Fr. Toner maintains this pneumatological focus for the entire introductory chapter. As he asserts at the end of the chapter, “this book aims at providing a practical Christian theology of openness to the Holy Spirit” (51).

⁷³ Toner, *A Commentary*, 9.

⁷⁴ Toner, *A Commentary*, 9n6.

⁷⁵ Toner, *A Commentary*, 95; see also 96 and 97.

A third example of the sort comes from Sr. Noëlle Hausman's reading of the "Spiritual Diary," which the Rome-based *Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis* published as "Ignatius Loyola and the Mission of the Holy Spirit."⁷⁶ Here, I simply want to draw attention to the pneumatological focus of Hausman's reading, as the title of the article suggests and the conclusion confirms, where she highlights, under the subheading "Summary: The Path of the Holy Spirit," the Spirit's role in the Trinity's self-communication to Ignatius and confirmation of his choice for poverty.⁷⁷ The following quotation represents well Hausman's pneumatological reading of the "Diary:"

The Spirit revealed himself in person as the confirmation of the offering and as purifying joy, and in the experience of loving submission and of mutual presence. The year of prayer-periods in the "Spiritual Diary" therefore shows how the gift of the Holy Spirit brought about Ignatius's intimate reconciliation not only with the Trinity or the Divine Persons, but also with his own perceptions and deepest desires.⁷⁸

Here, while the Holy Spirit does indeed play an important role in the "Spiritual Diary," Sr. Hausman amplifies this role beyond what the text warrants and ignores the trinitarian problems that indicated above. Furthermore, we should expect a scholarly reading of the "Diary" to address the pneumatological contrast with the *Spiritual Exercises*, especially given that Hausman opens her text by evoking the close link between the "Diary" and the *Exercises*—a link that, regarding to the Holy Spirit, does not exist.⁷⁹

In summary, these examples all illustrate a first approach to the pneumatological ambiguity in Ignatius's writings by simply ignoring

⁷⁶ Noëlle Hausman, "Ignatius Loyola and the Mission of the Holy Spirit: An Interpretation of the Spiritual Diary (1544–1545)," *Review of Ignatian Spirituality* (*Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis*) 63–64 (1990): 39–59.

⁷⁷ Hausman, "Ignatius Loyola and the Mission of the Holy Spirit," 58–59.

⁷⁸ Hausman, "Ignatius Loyola and the Mission of the Holy Spirit," 59.

⁷⁹ The opening line of the article reads, "'In a certain sense, the *Diary* is no more than the *Exercises* in action', writes one expert [Simon Decloux]"; see Hausman, "Ignatius Loyola and the Mission of the Holy Spirit," 39.

it and speaking as if the Holy Spirit forms an integral part of his spirituality as recorded in those texts. However, while this approach acknowledges the Holy Spirit's role in salvation history and thus avoids the pitfall of overlooking the Holy Spirit, the sources do not warrant it.⁸⁰

3. Explaining the Issue

A second type of response problematizes the pneumatological ambiguity and attempts to explain it with reference to historical and cultural context. Among these attempts, the strongest claims that Ignatius avoided talk of the Holy Spirit because he wanted to counter suspicions that he belonged to the Spanish spiritual movement of the *alumbrados*. This movement consisted mainly of people with little theological training who emphasized personal illumination through the Holy Spirit's direct interaction as opposed to receiving knowledge mediated through church structures and other sources.⁸¹ And in fact, when Polanco prefaced a later edition of the *Exercises* praising Ignatius for composing the *Exercises* "from his own inner experience and from the inner unction of

⁸⁰ See also Maurice Giuliani, "Les motions de l'esprit," *Christus* 153 (hors série) (1992): 83–96. Note how he highlights the Holy Spirit without mentioning Ignatius's limited references to the Spirit: "Les consolations et désolations constituent ces « motions » dont saint Ignace parle si souvent, signes de la présence vivante de l'Esprit-Saint dans l'âme. . . . Le secret et l'efficacité de la spiritualité de saint Ignace réside peut-être en cette manière de ramener les âmes à la pleine conscience de l'Esprit qui agit en elles, et de les conduire ainsi à une décision de sainteté pour laquelle, plutôt que l'héroïsme, elles ont besoin de soumission parfaite à une volonté transcendante qui les « meut » au-dedans d'elles-mêmes" (84–85). For another English example, see Michael Ivens, *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises: Text and Commentary. A Handbook for Retreat Directors* (Herefordshire: Gracewing, 1998). Fr. Ivens consistently references to the Spirit, as here: "The Exercises have to do with the *conversion* of affectivity, with letting the Spirit enter into our affectivity, change it and act through it" (2). See also Codina, "Claves para una hermenéutica de los Ejercicios"; Guy Lepoutre, "L'Esprit dans la pensée d'Ignace," *Christus* 37 (1990): 477–85. Joseph Thomas, "À l'école de l'Esprit. Le discernement des esprits selon Ignace de Loyola," *Vie spirituelle* 138 (1984): 338–49; Rogelio García Mateo, "Lo Spirito Santo negli Esercizi Ignaziani," *Gregorianum* 80 (1999): 95–119, published in Spanish as "Dimensión pneumatológica de los Ejercicios Espirituales," in *Ignacio de Loyola: Su espiritualidad y su mundo cultural* (Bilbao: Mensajero, 2000), 353–71.

⁸¹ For what follows, see Rafael Maria Sanz de Diego, "Alumbrados," in *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*, 130–3.

the Holy Spirit rather than from books," some censors responded that this sounded very much like the *alumbrados*.⁸²

In all likelihood, concern about this privatized approach to divine revelation prompted the Dominicans in Salamanca to interrogate Ignatius about whether he understood what he taught to come through studies or directly from the Holy Spirit. And since he had not studied theology, his only possible answer—that what he taught came directly from the Spirit—would have confirmed suspicions that he was an *alumbrado*. Recognizing this trap, as we read in his "Autobiography," Ignatius did not respond: "Here the pilgrim was a little wary, as this way of arguing did not seem good to him. And after having been silent a while, he said that there was no need to speak more about these matters."⁸³

Regarding this incident, Dutch Jesuit Leo Bakker (1926–1993), perhaps the first author to point out and explain what he called "the silence of the *Exercises* about the Holy Spirit," highlights Ignatius's negative experiences with the Dominicans in Salamanca.⁸⁴ Of course, like the *alumbrados*, Ignatius had begun to teach about spiritual matters prior to receiving theological formation, and neither Ignatius nor the *alumbrados* had received Holy Orders. Furthermore, Ignatius, like the *alumbrados*, insists on God's direct interaction, appreciates spiritual indifference, and teaches the discernment of spirits, as apparent in the *Spiritual Exercises*.⁸⁵ However, as Fr. Bakker indicates, Ignatius intentionally speaks

⁸² See Fr. Lera's account of the events surrounding the approval of the *Exercises*, in "La contemplación para alcanzar amor," 182–83.

⁸³ Ignatius of Loyola, "Reminiscences (Autobiography)," 65, in *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings*; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 45.

⁸⁴ Leo Bakker, *Freiheit und Erfahrung. Redaktionsgeschichtliche Untersuchungen über die Unterscheidung der Geister bei Ignatius von Loyola* (Würzburg: Echter Verlag, 1970), 302; the subheading reads "Das Schweigen der Exerzitien über den Heiligen Geist," 302–3. Fr. Bakker raises the question in the context of his statement that Christ's consolation is also the Spirit's: "Weil diese Wahrheit in den GÜ so wenig oder gar nicht betont wird, lohnt es sich, ausführlicher darauf einzugehen" (300).

⁸⁵ Terence O'Reilly discusses these and other elements at length in O'Reilly, "The *Spiritual Exercises* and Illuminism in Spain: Dominican Critics of the Early Society of Jesus," in *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola*, 81–105. He concludes: "Ignatius was never one of the *alumbrados*, but there are parallels between his spirituality and their teachings, particularly those of the *recogidos*. These parallels touch on elements of the

in the rules of “angels” rather than spirits so as to avoid the accusation of *alumbradismo*.⁸⁶ To support this point, Bakker notes that, while a very early version of the Rules, the so-called Cologne manuscript, relates spiritual joy and consolation to God, the angels, and the Holy Spirit, the reference to the Spirit had disappeared in later versions.⁸⁷

Fr. Egan follows Fr. Bakker in this perspective, opening his discussion on Ignatian mysticism and the Holy Spirit pointing out the lack of Spirit references in the *Exercises*, offering the suspicion of *alumbradismo* as an explanation, and referencing the Cologne manuscript.⁸⁸ Now, the *alumbrados* explanation appears regularly, as in Fr. Lera’s entry on the Holy Spirit in the *Dictionary of Ignatian Spirituality* (2007), Fr. Codina’s reflection on the Spirit’s “silent presence” in the *Spiritual Exercises* (2011), and chapters in books by Bert Daelemans (ELC) (2016) and Terence O’Reilly (2021).⁸⁹

Exercises connected with their ‘dynamic,’ a dynamic driven by the summons of ‘the Creator and Lord,’ who disposes the soul toward the way that will best serve Him” (101).

⁸⁶ Bakker, *Freiheit und Erfahrung*, 301-2; the subheading reads “Der Vorwurf des Illuminatentums gegen Ignatius.”

⁸⁷ The passage from the Cologne manuscript reads, “It is characteristic of most-holy God and the holy angels to give in their motions true gladness and the joy of the spirit, and to take away all sadness and distress, which Satan usually brings with him. In turn, it is characteristic of the devil to act against such joy and consolation of the Holy Spirit [*contra talem laetitiam et consolationem Spiritus Sancti*], by manifesting specious and subtle arguments that are difficult,” quoted in Bakker, *Freiheit und Erfahrung*, 304–5, with reference to the *MHSI Exercitia*, vol. 1. The page numbers in Bakker are mistake: the correct page number is 500, no. 329; see also no. 334, which speaks of “the gentleness [*suavitas*] and joy of the Holy Spirit, that he [the Christian] was earlier strengthened by [*reficiebatur*].”

⁸⁸ Egan, *The Spiritual Exercises and the Ignatian Mystical Horizon*, 120. Bakker has remained a point of reference, as in O’Reilly, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola*, 103n84.

⁸⁹ José Maria Lera, “Espíritu Santo”, *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*, 803–11 at 804; Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 7–8; Daelemans, “Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades,” 208–9; O’Reilly, “The *Spiritual Exercises* and Illuminism in Spain,” 81–105. Already in 1998, Santiago Arzubialde described the *alumbrados* argument as a common explanation, adding that he did not agree with it, which places him in the minority. See Arzubialde, “Discernimiento – Unción del Espíritu – y discreto,” 231–32.

Other explanations apart from *alumbradismo* appear in the scholarship, albeit with less consensus. For example, Fr. Arzubialde argues that Ignatius belonged to a christomonistic theological culture, although he insists that Ignatius acted freely: "When he believes he needs to [mention the Spirit], he simply does so."⁹⁰ Fr. Codina also points out that Ignatius, as a man of his time, emphasized christology and adds that Marian devotion took the place of what, from a dogmatic perspective, theologians would more properly have considered the role of the Spirit.⁹¹

Other commentators emphasize the development of Ignatius's theological thinking. For example, Fr. Bakker claims that Ignatius initially had little awareness of the Holy Spirit and over time would gain pneumatological insight. To substantiate his claim, he recalls that the La Storta experience singles out only the Father and the Son while that letters of a later date do mention the Spirit.⁹² Likewise, Fr. Lera, in his 1981 article on the pneumatology of the *Exercises*, explains, on the basis of, among other texts, the Preamble of the *Constitutions*, that "at the end of his life, Ignatius was speaking about the Holy Spirit ever more loudly [*en tono cada vez más alto*]."⁹³

⁹⁰ Arzubialde, "Discernimiento – Unción del Espíritu – y discreto," 232, 233.

⁹¹ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 5–6. Fr. Codina also recalls a psychological explanation for Ignatius's devotion to Mary—namely, Ignatius's loss of his mother at a young age. For other references to the cultural influence on Ignatius, see Juan Manuel, who speaks of the Western theological and spiritual tradition, in Manuel, "El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales," 360; also José María Lera, "Apuntes para una pneumatología de los Ejercicios. En el XVI centenario del Concilio I de Constantinopla. Segunda Parte. Cristología de la cuarta semana: el Espíritu como marca de referencia," *Manresa* 58 (1986): 99–128 at 99–100. Barton Geger makes a brief reference to Ignatius's love for christocentric mystical body ecclesiology as a possible explanation for the paucity of references to the Spirit; see *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, ed. Geger, 213n384.

⁹² Bakker, *Freiheit und Erfahrung*, 303–4.

⁹³ Lera, "Apuntes para una pneumatología de los Ejercicios," 343–51 at 351. The "Apuntes" article appears in his 2016 book under the title "*Ejercicios Espirituales* y evolución mística de Ignacio," which suggests that Lera continued to develop the hypothesis of Ignatius's growth in matters pneumatological. Another author, Manuel Ruiz, speaks without much elaboration about a "progresiva explicitación del tema del Espíritu en la consciencia del santo," in Ruiz, "El Espíritu Santo en la espiritualidad ignaciana," 218; also at 217.

A more hermeneutical explanation highlights the difference between what a person experiences and how a person puts that experience into words. As Fr. Lera puts it, “the experience of the Holy Spirit is one thing, the reflection on or elaboration of that experience by means of communicable concepts is another matter.”⁹⁴ In developing this point, both Fr. Lera and Fr. Manuel focus on topics where they claim the Spirit implicitly present, as in consolation and in the immediacy of a believer’s relationship with God, and we will return to this below.⁹⁵

As for other explanations, Fr. Manuel references the Spirit’s natural elusiveness.⁹⁶ In this vein, Fr. Daelemans attributes the Ignatian silence to the fact that the Spirit reveals his gifts, rather than himself.⁹⁷ Finally, we might also consider differences in genre among the *Exercises*, the *Constitutions*, the “Diary,” and the Letters.⁹⁸

The contextual approach, in its various manifestations presented in this section, expands our understanding of the early Ignatian pneumatological ambiguity. For example, in all likelihood, the weak pneumatology of Ignatius’s theological and spiritual context did influence how he spoke about religious experience, just as he probably recognized the danger of such accusations as *alumbradismo*. Likewise, the thesis that Ignatius developed over time a theological articulation of the Holy Spirit seems credible. However, I would argue that, while this approach helpfully provides reasons for Ignatius’s pneumatological ambiguity, it does not resolve the issue at hand.

⁹⁴ Lera, “Apuntes para una pneumatología de los Ejercicios,” 336, see also Manuel, “El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales,” 361, with reference to Lera.

⁹⁵ Manuel, “El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales,” 362–63 (immediacy) and 367–69 (consolation); and Lera’s entire article “Apuntes para una pneumatología de los Ejercicios. Segunda Parte.”

⁹⁶ Manuel, “El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales,” 360.

⁹⁷ Daelemans, “Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades,” 239–40.

⁹⁸ Ruiz, “El Espíritu Santo en la espiritualidad ignaciana,” 217.

4. Recognizing The Spirit as Implicitly Present

A third type of response to the pneumatological ambiguity in Ignatius's writings seeks to solve the problem by framing it in terms of the Spirit's implicit presence. The idea is that, while a source may not mention the Spirit explicitly, we still can perceive the reality and action of the Spirit "between the lines," so to speak. Typically, authors like Fr. Codina, in his booklet on the Holy Spirit and the *Exercises* (2011), will identify in the text what we might call thin spaces.⁹⁹ After first thematizing and explaining, in the first section of the booklet, the "suspect silence" regarding the Spirit, Codina presents in the second section a pneumatological reading: "una relectura de los Ejercicios desde el Espíritu."¹⁰⁰ The aim is to uncover the Spirit's subtle presence: "hidden, almost absent, silent."¹⁰¹ Terence O'Reilly sums up as follows the essence of this approach: "The *Exercises*, it is true, do not ascribe this divine action explicitly to the Holy Spirit, but implicit in them is a rich pneumatology, which modern commentators have sought to bring out."¹⁰² In this section, I will present several ways in which commentators have made this argument.

In the first place, some argue that we should understand the *Spiritual Exercises* as pneumatological in a general sense at the level of what Fr. Codina calls "transversal themes."¹⁰³ From this perspective, various aspects of the *Exercises* allow for a pneumatological interpretation. For example, considering the Pauline contrast between spirit and flesh, Co-

⁹⁹ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*; the word "thin spaces" is mine.

¹⁰⁰ The title of the first part is "Un silencio sospechoso," see Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 3–8; for the "relectura," see Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 9–25. Lera helpfully clarifies that we should not think of this as actualization, but simply as making explicit what Ignatius meant without saying it: "No se trata de una relectura actualizadora de Ignacio. Se trata más bien de leer a Ignacio tal cual es, sin las presiones y tensiones que había en su tiempo," in José María Lera, "La contemplación para alcanzar amor," 183. In an earlier article, he had spoken of the "búsqueda paciente del Espíritu," in Lera, "Cristología de la cuarta semana: el Espíritu como marca de referencia," 100.

¹⁰¹ The type of presence Codina is looking for "no será clamorosa, sino oculta, casi ausente, silenciosa, incluso tal vez deliberadamente silenciada," Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 10.

¹⁰² O'Reilly, *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola*, 96–97.

¹⁰³ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 11; for what follows, see 11–16.

dina suggests that we might understand the adjective “spiritual” in *Spiritual Exercises* to indicate the Holy Spirit. Also, Ignatius speaks of “the one who gives the exercises” instead of a more straightforward title like *spiritual director*.¹⁰⁴ Here, Codina emphasizes that such people accompany not because of a hierarchical position or psychological expertise but by virtue of an indwelling of the Holy Spirit. In addition, Codina thematizes as pneumatological Ignatius’s repeated emphasis on “the interior sensing and relishing of things” rather than knowledge.¹⁰⁵ So also does he treat both Ignatius’s stress on God’s direct interaction with his creatures and Ignatius’s use of the Examen, which Codina understands as an exercise in becoming aware of and growing in fidelity to the Spirit in our daily lives.¹⁰⁶ Finally, it is the Spirit who drives our striving for “el más,” to which we now often refer as the *magis*.¹⁰⁷

Fr. Manuel takes a correlate approach but in reverse, beginning with a discussion of the characteristics of the Spirit—immediacy, interiority, gratuitousness, discernment, consolation, the actualization of Jesus, and ecclesiality (*eclesialidad*)—and then indicating where these qualities appear in the *Exercises*.¹⁰⁸ For example, he links the way in which the Spirit interacts immediately with people to the key instruction in the *Exercises* that the director should let God deal directly with his creature.¹⁰⁹

An especially interesting instance of a pneumatological re-reading of the *Spiritual Exercises* focuses on the Rules for Discernment.¹¹⁰ As the argument goes, since Ignatius intended the Rules to help navigate the spiritual movements that the *Exercises* should provoke, the Rules could go along with the Annotations at the beginning of the book rather

¹⁰⁴ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 11.

¹⁰⁵ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 11–12, with reference to *SpEx* 2; see also *SpEx* 63, 65, 104, 193, 233.

¹⁰⁶ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 12–13 (for God’s direct interaction with the retreatant, with reference to *SpEx* 15) and 13–14 (for the Examen).

¹⁰⁷ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 14–16.

¹⁰⁸ Manuel, “El don del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios espirituales,” 5–16.

¹⁰⁹ *SpEx* 15.

¹¹⁰ *SpEx* 313–36; Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 17–20.

than at the end.¹¹¹ From this perspective, as the very expression “Rules for Discernment” implies, Ignatius intended the Rules to help discern which movements in the soul retreatants should accept and which ones they should reject. In other words, a pneumatological understanding of the Rules would imply a pneumatological understanding of the *Exercises* as a whole.

Of course, as discussed, the Rules do not mention the Holy Spirit. However, Fr. Codina argues that Paul uses pneumatological language to describe discerning the spirits: “do not quench the Spirit . . . but test everything; hold fast to what is good. Abstain from every form of evil.”¹¹² Moreover, Codina follows Jesús Corella (1909–2004) in finding a trinitarian structure in Ignatius’s description of consolation, which moves from love for the Creator through being touched by Christ’s passion to “every increase of faith, hope and charity, all interior happiness that calls and attracts a person towards heavenly things and to the soul’s salvation, leaving the soul quiet and at peace in her Creator and Lord.”¹¹³ This progression corresponds clearly with the fruits of the Spirit that Paul presents in Galatians, and Codina mentions similarities with other Scripture texts.¹¹⁴

Finally, this pneumatological interpretation of the Rules finds support in an early Directory for giving the *Exercises* handwritten by Ignatius himself, where he explicitly makes the connection. As part of an instruction for the spiritual director on how to teach about consolation and desolation, Ignatius states that “The second [rule] is about consolation and desolation, he [the spiritual director] must explain much what consolation is, going through all its aspects, such as: interior peace, spir-

¹¹¹ *SpEx* 6.

¹¹² 1 Th 5:19–22; Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 17.

¹¹³ *SpEx* 316; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 349; Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 18, with reference to Jesús Corella’s lemma “Consolación” in the *Diccionario de espiritualidad ignaciana*.

¹¹⁴ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 18–19, with reference to Ga 5:22, Rm 8:5–10, Jn 20:19–23; Jn 16:13.20–22. One also can hear Galatians 5 echo in Ignatius’s commentary on desolation and its worldliness (*SpEx* 314, 317).

itual joy, hope, faith, love, tears and the mind's elevation, all of which are gifts of the Holy Spirit."¹¹⁵

Moving now to focus on the Fourth Week, Fr. Lera suggests that various brief references reveal this moment as deeply pneumatological.¹¹⁶ Specifically, he highlights the "really true and holy effects" that the Resurrection causes and upon which the retreatant should dwell, Christ's office as consoler, and the grace "to feel gladness and to rejoice intensely over the great glory and joy of Christ our Lord."¹¹⁷ American theologian Randy Sachs (UEA) also makes the case for a pneumatological reading of the Fourth Week, and the fact that he does so without any references to the Spanish scholarship on Ignatian pneumatology suggests the strength of this reading.¹¹⁸

As Fr. Lera continues his analysis of the Fourth Week, he delves deeply into the culmination point of that moment, the *Contemplatio ad amorem*, presenting it essentially as a meditation on Pentecost.¹¹⁹ Here, Fr. Lera observes that the opening notes of the *Contemplatio*, in which

¹¹⁵ See "Directorio autógrafo de san Ignacio," in *Los Directorios de Ejercicios 1540–1599*, ed. Miguel Lop Sebastià (Bilbao: Mensajero, 2000), 19–22 at 21. I learned of this text from Giuliani, "Les motions de l'esprit," 87, but his reference to the *Monumenta* seems wrong; for the right page number, see *MHSI, Exercitia*, vol. 2, 72, repeated at 73. For more commentary, see Daelemans, "Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades," 213–17.

¹¹⁶ Lera, "Cristología de la cuarta semana: el Espíritu como marca de referencia," 101 ("¿no es aquí, en esta cuarta semana, donde debemos percibir primero con más intensidad el Espíritu, que ya ha estado operando a lo largo de todo el proceso de los Ejercicios?") and 114 ("La cuarta semana ... parece ser ... el lugar donde deba darse el clímax de la explicitación trinitaria (en concreto, manifestación del Espíritu) en el proceo de los Ejercicios"), elaborated 114–23.

¹¹⁷ *SpEx* 221; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 327; see also *SpEx* 223, 224.

¹¹⁸ John R. Sachs, "The Spirit of the Risen Lord," *Way Supplement* 99 (2000): 22–34 at 22–24.

¹¹⁹ For instance, Lera, "La contemplación para alcanzar amor," 166: "Sin intentar probar más, creemos resulta evidente que Ignacio ha colocado la 'Contemplación para alcanzar amor' en el lugar donde cabía esperar la meditación sobre el Misterio de Pentecostés o la efusión del Espíritu Santo." Fr. Codina follows him (Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 23–25). See also Ignacio Iglesias, "La contemplación para alcanzar amor en la dinámica de los Ejercicios Espirituales," *Manresa* 59 (1987): 373–87 at 381–3; Sachs, "The Spirit of the Risen Lord," 24–32.

Ignatius speaks of love that consists of giving and communicating, resonate with how Augustine and subsequent Western theologians understand the Trinity as lover, loved, love.¹²⁰ Indeed, Fr. Lera has no doubt about his pneumatological reading of the text: “With the words *love, communication, and give*, Ignatius is indeed, following the terminology of Augustine and the Tradition, naming the Holy Spirit.”¹²¹

He goes on to analyze other sections of the *contemplatio*. In the aim stated in the second prelude—namely, “so that ... I may be able to love and serve”—he highlights the word “be able to [*poder*],” suggesting that the Spirit enables us to love God.¹²² He makes a similar point regarding the phrase “give me your love and grace; that is enough for me [*dadme vuestro amor y gracia, que ésta me basta*]” in the *Sucipe*, and also draws attention to the trinitarian rhythm of the benefits listed in the first point—“creation, redemption, and particular gifts”—and to the trinitarian Augustinian echoes in “memory, understanding and my entire will.”¹²³ Finally, he highlights the use of the preposition “in” in the second, third, and fourth points, asking, “isn’t this an Eastern manner to name the Holy Spirit?”¹²⁴

Similar ideas appear in other commentaries, as in Fr. Giuliani’s pneumatological reading of repetition and of the need to confirm decisions.¹²⁵ Likewise, Fr. Daelemans refers to von Balthasar’s conviction

¹²⁰ *SpEx* 231. Augustine stated: “Ecce tria sunt, amans et quod amatur et amor,” *Trin* 8.14, referenced in Lera, “La contemplación para alcanzar amor,” 172.

¹²¹ Lera, “La contemplación para alcanzar amor,” 173.

¹²² Lera, “La contemplación para alcanzar amor,” 173; *SpEx* 233; trans. Munitiz and Endean, 329.

¹²³ Lera, “La contemplación para alcanzar amor,” 174; *SpEx* 234, with a partly different translation in Munitiz and Endean, 329. As Lera reminds and is commonly known, Augustine suggests that these three human capacities existing within the one person help to imagine the Trinity. See for instance Augustine of Hippo, “Sermon 52. Translated by Mark DelCogliano,” in *The Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings*, ed. Andrew Radde-Gallwitz (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017), 311–27.

¹²⁴ Lera, “La contemplación para alcanzar amor,” 176; *SpEx* 235–237.

¹²⁵ *SpEx* 62, 183; Giuliani, “Les motions de l’esprit,” 89–94. See also the very brief reflection on the “presencia global del Espíritu Santo en los Ejercicios” in Jurado, “El Espíritu Santo en la espiritualidad ignaciana,” 221–22.

that the process of the retreatant interacting with the text through imagining the place, being present, and allowing oneself to be touched implies the action of the Holy Spirit.¹²⁶

As we conclude this section, note that this third approach is substantially different from the second one. In positing the unnamed Spirit's presence and identifying its operation, it *resolves* the problem of an absence of pneumatological language. Where the second approach explained, this one rereads.¹²⁷

5. Why Bother?

Before evaluating these strategies, we pause to consider why bother at all about explicit or implicit references to the Holy Spirit since, from a dogmatic perspective, the *Exercises'* christocentric approach surely must imply the presence the Spirit.

I see three reasons to bother. In the first case, any given expression of the Trinitarian faith such as the *Exercises* should acknowledge explicitly that salvation comes from the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. In other words, unqualified christocentrism presents a problem, as does an implicit pneumatology that does not name the Holy Spirit.

This leads to a second reason, pastoral-spiritual in nature, in that naming the Spirit strengthens the conviction that God enables Christians to live out their calling. In other words, since the Spirit stirs up constructive desires, inspires insight and wisdom, warms hearts, emboldens us to bear suffering, and whispers softly that God accompanies us no matter what, failing to mention the Spirit risks shifting the focus to our own efforts. From this perspective, the Ignatian way could appear

¹²⁶ Daelemans, "Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades," 212–13.

¹²⁷ Fr. Daelemans finds in the *Constitutions*, too, an implicit pneumatology: "Desde estas menciones explícitas del Espíritu Santo en las Constituciones, podremos ampliar el marco de la pneumatología ignaciana, discerniendo la presencia implícita del Espíritu en las ocurrencias del «espíritu» escrito con minúscula"; see Daelemans, "Pneumatología ignaciana en el cruce de voluntades," 229.

as a predominantly ascetic and moral undertaking rather than a path to life beyond ourselves.

On this point, Fr. Codina has indicated that a pneumatological approach to the Examen prayer and to self-examination in general helps to live those spiritual practices in a way that goes beyond a moralistic “school of the will” and rather offers an exercise “to free ourselves from all disordered affections to favor the Spirit’s action in us, to ensure our fidelity to the Spirit, to be able to be docile to the Spirit, thereby enabling us “to submit to and to follow the Spirit.”¹²⁸ On this same point, we recall Fr. Arrupe’s address on Ignatius’s trinitarian mysticism, by which he intended to call Jesuits to draw on the intimacy of God for the sake of their own lives and ministry. In other words, his address suggests that speaking correctly about God has a spiritual as well as a formal significance.

Finally, a third “reason-to-bother” addressing pneumatology in the *Exercises* has to do with the distinctiveness of the Spirit’s contribution to salvation history. The issue here is that theologians generally hesitate to correlate divine action to a specific person of the Trinity since doing so can suggest tri-theism. However, I would argue that, while we should balance the specificity of the Spirit’s action with the unity of the Godhead, we can imagine the action of the Spirit as complementing that of the other divine persons. From this perspective, speaking about the action of the Spirit respects the mechanism of human thought, which operates by making distinctions. As such, we can avoid tri-theism by promoting complementarity among the specific actions of the divine persons. For instance, the action of Christ, who has wrought redemption once and for all, complements that of the Spirit, who actualizes that redemption in specific contexts here and now.

Benedictine scholar Kilian McDonnell describes this complementarity:

Without the mission of the Spirit the mysterious acts of Christ do not become real in us, but remain acts of an ancient wandering preacher who told memorable parables and lived a self-

¹²⁸ Codina, *Una presencia silenciosa*, 13; the Spanish reads “El examen nos ayuda a someternos al Espíritu”; see also p. 11. He goes so far as to qualify Ignatius’s way of thinking (*mentalidad*) as “deformada por la obligación de silenciar al Espíritu” (26).

less life. Without the mission of the Spirit . . . the mission of the Son lacks the specific weight of God. . . . Without the mission of the Spirit the church remains in fixity, a splendid stasis, frozen in time, without movement, without an end. Without the mission of the Spirit what is left of faith and experience are the dried structural bones of religion.¹²⁹

Of course, the work of the Son also complements that of the Spirit, since “without the mission of the Son the mission of the Spirit is devoid of the flesh and materiality that make salvation history possible.”¹³⁰ Nevertheless, since this essay focuses on the Holy Spirit, we highlight that without the work of the Spirit, we lose something important. The Spirit, whom we confess in the Creed as the life-giver, brings salvation alive in specific people at specific times and in specific places.

In summary, without the Holy Spirit, we lose something in terms of principles, spirituality, and salvation history. For this reason, a full expression of Christianity needs to acknowledge explicitly the Spirit and his work. In my view, therefore, the strategies discussed in parts 3 and 4 of this essay are, ultimately, unsatisfactory. The pneumatological ambiguity of the *Exercises* seems an intellectual puzzle either to explain and understand (part 3) or to resolve by importing a theological principle such that we find the unnamed Spirit “in between the lines” of the text (part 4).

In my estimation, these approaches lack two essential elements. First, they lack the express acknowledgement that not mentioning the Holy Spirit remains problematic even when we find explanations or posit an implied pneumatology—as if whether we mention the Spirit makes no real difference. Second, these responses, which appeal to the intellect, lack a pastoral translation, as if understanding something suffices. With this in mind, we need to consider what guidance we can provide for ministers who wish to present Ignatian spirituality with explicit reference to the Holy Spirit; that is what I will argue in the concluding part below.

¹²⁹ Kilian McDonnell, *The Other Hand of God: The Holy Spirit as the Universal Touch and Goal* (Collegeville, MI: Liturgical Press, 2003), 227–29 at 228.

¹³⁰ McDonnell, *The Other Hand of God*, 229.

6. Pastoral and Practical Considerations

To recap, we began by briefly outlining what I have called the “pneumatological ambiguity” in early Ignatian sources—namely, that in some of his writings, Ignatius references the Holy Spirit often and explicitly while in other places, including, surprisingly, the *Spiritual Exercises*, where we might expect many such references, he does not. Then, we considered three responses to that ambiguity—ignoring, explaining, and “reading between the lines.” Finally, in response to the question “why bother with this study at all?” I proposed that, for a complete faith-life, Christians need an explicitly pneumatological reimagination of Ignatian spirituality and practice.

So, what might such a reimagination mean? Really, it involves no more than speaking often to retreatants about the Holy Spirit. For example, when presenting themes like interior motions, consolation, or inner knowledge, the spiritual director should cast these in explicitly pneumatological language, explaining that the Spirit works through these experiences. As such, director and retreatant alike ought to welcome as the Spirit’s gifts the experiences of deeper insight into Christ, gratitude, quiet peace, and simplicity. In this same vein, the spiritual director might invite the retreatant to a colloquy with the Holy Spirit in addition to colloquies with Mary, the Son, or the Father. And in this same vein, the retreatant should add the mystery of Pentecost to the Fourth Week, as Polanco discreetly suggested.¹³¹ Finally, the director should make explicit the underlying point of the *Contemplatio ad amorem*, namely, that the Spirit brings about the communication of love to which Ignatius invites the retreatant.

Note that this proposal to make explicit what has remained implicit or unstated aligns very much with what Fr. Egan stated back in 1976. One of the few commentators to address the pastoral and practical implications of greater intellectual insight in Ignatian pneumatology, he claimed that retreat directors should change the way they propose the

¹³¹ *MHSI Exercitia*, vol. 2, 322: “Hoc Exercitium ad amorem excitandum proponi poterit postquam unum vel alterum diem, qui exercetur, in misteriis Resurrectionis (sub Resurrectione autem, Ascensionis et Pentecostes etiam misteria intellegi) versatur erit.” See also footnote 55.

Exercises. He writes, “Now that the dangers and the exaggerations from Illuminism are scarcely present, the exercitant must be explicitly told that the Exercises will evoke, deepen, strengthen and make more explicit the ever-present experience of the Holy Spirit.”¹³² Therefore, “when the retreat director explains the essentials of each meditation to the exercitant (*SpEx* 2), he ought to develop their latent pneumatology.”¹³³

This proposal builds on what other experts have done, with subtle yet significant differences. Similar to how Fr. Arrupe, Fr. Toner, and Sr. Hausman present Ignatian spirituality, I propose to explicitly speak of the Spirit. Yet different from them, I believe we should do so after *first* admitting the gravity of the situation. Healing can only happen after the wound has been acknowledged. Giving full weight to the textual problem in the Ignatian corpus presses to seek a better way forward and suggests where exactly that better way forward is needed. Thus, overtly mentioning, and then problematizing, that certain texts remain largely silent on the Spirit, is very necessary.

In addition, my proposal aligns with (and builds on) the arguments of Fr. Codina, Fr. Lera, and others who suggested how and where the Holy Spirit’s unarticulated presence may operate implicitly in the dynamics of the *Exercises*. Their reflections helpfully indicate what topics could be reimagined pneumatologically. My contribution consists in urging the next step. After intellectually reconstructing the Spirit’s presence and operation—and, once again, acknowledging that the absence of an explicit pneumatology is problematic—the much-needed next step is to think and speak differently. What has remained unnamed in the text must be explicitly stated and confessed.

Importantly, this pneumatological reimagination of Ignatian spirituality leaves the text of the *Spiritual Exercises* untouched yet, much as the *Complementary Norms* provide a lens for interpreting the *Constitutions*, it references the Spirit throughout. Note that, as I see it, there is no need for spiritual directors and retreat directors to burden their directees with elaborate considerations on the difference between the text

¹³² Egan, *The Spiritual Exercises and the Ignatian Mystical Horizon*, 122.

¹³³ Egan, *The Spiritual Exercises and the Ignatian Mystical Horizon*, 126.

of the *Exercises* and its modern understanding. In a pastoral context, it seems sufficient to present simply and succinctly the lack of references to the Spirit, the problem that it represents, and the way forward: mentioning the Holy Spirit often.

Reimaginings like this should not be considered controversial; they have occurred frequently since the Second Vatican Council. For instance, in the late 1970s, David Fleming published an edition of the *Spiritual Exercises* with both a literal translation and a “contemporary reading” on facing pages.¹³⁴ In this reading, for example, he replaces Ignatius’s presentation of the devil as a woman with that of a “spoiled child.”¹³⁵ Likewise, in 2001, three religious sisters of the Holy Names of Jesus and Mary explained and reformulated the *Exercises* so that they would speak to women more easily.¹³⁶ Then, more recently, Mark Thibodeaux (ucs) developed more than thirty variations on the Examen Prayer.¹³⁷ In fact, some adaptations we miss completely. As Dominique Salin (EOF) argues convincingly, the numinous world of spirits and angels as Ignatius and his contemporaries knew it—and which Pierre Favre’s *Diary* illustrates so well—is no more.¹³⁸ Now, spiritual directors rely generally on introspection as a means to access psychological and spiritual “inner movements.”¹³⁹ All of these projects have in common with mine the quest to draw life from the Ignatian charism in a way relevant and convincing to Christians today—something that a contemporary account of Ignatian spirituality cannot do without explicitly referencing the vivifying action of the Holy Spirit.

¹³⁴ David Fleming, *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius: A Literal Translation and a Contemporary Reading* (St. Louis, MO: IJS, 1978).

¹³⁵ SpEx 325; Fleming, *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, 210–11.

¹³⁶ Katherine Dyckman, Mary Garvin, and Elizabeth Liebert, *The Spiritual Exercises Reclaimed: Uncovering Liberating Possibilities for Women* (New York: Paulist Press, 2001).

¹³⁷ Mark E. Thibodeaux, *Reimagining the Ignatian Examen: Fresh Ways to Pray from Your Day* (Chicago: Loyola Press, 2015).

¹³⁸ Dominique Salin, *Le discernement des esprits selon Ignace de Loyola : Les aléas d’une transmission (xvii–xxi siècle)* (Brussels: Lessius, 2021), see especially 54–68 (“Les esprits chez Pierre Favre”) and 133–176 (“Après Ignace: des esprits aux passions”).

¹³⁹ See also Brian O’Leary, *Pierre Favre and Discernment: The Discernment of Spirits in the Memoriale of Blessed Pierre Favre* (Oxford: Way Books, 2006), especially part 3, “Favre’s Understanding and Interpretation of ‘Spirits’ and Their Effects,” 72–93.

In this vein, I gladly acknowledge other reimaginings that would take into consideration and receive new impulses from emerging pneumatological perspectives. For example, liberation theologians have heard the Spirit of the Lord speak through those who suffer and call for justice.¹⁴⁰ Likewise, those who feel called to care for our common home might see the Spirit as the prophetic voice speaking through the earth's ecological distress.¹⁴¹ Other pneumatological reimaginings might draw on new perspectives from feminism, the global south, Black theology, ecumenism, other religions, and really any renewal impulses in culture and society that express the signs of the times.¹⁴²

In conclusion, I set about in this essay to acknowledge the pneumatological ambiguity of the early Ignatian sources and to present three ways of dealing with it. Finally, I suggested a fourth way of proceeding that effectively "mends" this ambiguity, namely, that practitioners of Ignatian spirituality should make explicit reference to the Holy Spirit regardless of what the text says. In all of this, my hope is to raise our consciousness of the Holy Spirit's life-giving role in Christian faith life and thereby to deepen our practice of Ignatian spirituality.¹⁴³

¹⁴⁰ See Joseph Comblin, *The Holy Spirit and Liberation* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1987) and Víctor Codina, *El Espíritu del Señor actúa desde abajo* (Santander: Sal Terrae, 2015).

¹⁴¹ See, for example, Elizabeth Johnson, "Creator Spirit in the Evolving World," in her *Quest for the Living God: Mapping Frontiers in the Theology of God* (New York: Continuum, 2011), 181–201. Denis Edwards, *Breath of Life: A Theology of the Creator Spirit* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2004). In 2000, Fr. Sachs developed fresh imaginations of the Spirit starting from nature and other religious traditions; see Sachs, "The Spirit of the Risen Lord," 28–29.

¹⁴² See, for example, Eugene F. Rogers, *After the Spirit: A Constructive Pneumatology from Resources outside the Modern West* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2005); Linda E. Thomas, "The Holy Spirit and Black Women: A Womanist Perspective," in *Christian Doctrines for Global Gender Justice*, ed. Jenny Daggers and Grace Ji-Sun Kim (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 73–88; Néstor Medina, "Theological Musings toward a Latina/o Pneumatology," in *The Wiley Blackwell Companion to Latino/a Theology*, ed. Orlando Espín (Malden, MA: 2015), 174–89; and Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2018).

¹⁴³ The following book was published after I completed this article: Nora Beatriz Kviatkovski, *La misión del Espíritu Santo en la experiencia ignaciana. Un estudio desde el epistolario de san Ignacio de Loyola* (Bilbao: Mensajero, 2026). Regrettably, I could not access for this study Daniel de Ycaza, "El Espíritu en los Ejercicios espirituales de san Ignacio," *Cuadernos de espiritualidad* 33 (2000): 85–115; and Antonio Queralt, *Il ruolo dello Spirito Santo nella spiritualità ignaziana*, (Rome: CIS, 1991).

Past Issues of STUDIES IN THE SPIRITUALITY OF JESUITS

- 1/1 John R. Sheets, *A Profile of the Contemporary Jesuit: His Challenges and Opportunities* (Sep 1969).
- 1/2 George E. Ganss, *The Authentic Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius: Some Facts of History and Terminology Basic to Their Functional Efficacy Today* (Nov 1969).
- 2/1 William J. Burke, *Institution and Person* (Feb 1970).
- 2/2 John Carroll Futrell, *Ignatian Discernment* (Apr 1970).
- 2/3 Bernard J. F. Lonergan, *The Response of the Jesuit, as Priest and Apostle, in the Modern World* (Sep 1970).
- 3/1 John H. Wright, *The Grace of Our Founder and the Grace of Our Vocation* (Feb 1971).
- 3/2 Vincent J. O'Flaherty, *Some Reflections on Jesuit Commitment* (Apr 1971).
- 3/3 Thomas E. Clarke, *Jesuit Commitment—Fraternal Covenant?*; John C. Haughey, *Another Perspective on Religious Commitment* (Jun 1971).
- 3/4 Jules J. Toner, *A Method for Communal Discernment of God's Will* (Sep 1971).
- 3/5 John R. Sheets, *Toward a Theology of the Religious Life: A Sketch, with Particular Reference to the Society of Jesus* (Nov 1971).
- 4/1 David B. Knight, *Saint Ignatius' Ideal of Poverty* (Jan 1972).
- 4/2 John R. Sheets, William W. Meissner, William J. Burke, Thomas E. Clarke, and John H. Wright, *Two Discussions: I. On Spiritual Direction [and] II. On Leadership and Authority* (Mar 1972).
- 4/3 Ladislav Orsy, *Some Questions about the Purpose and Scope of the General Congregation* (Jun 1972).
- 4/4 George E. Ganss, John H. Wright, John W. O'Malley, Leo J. O'Donovan, and Avery Dulles, *On Continuity and Change: A Symposium* (Oct 1972).
- 4/5 John Carroll Futrell, *Communal Discernment: Reflections on Experience* (Nov 1972).
- 5/1–5/2 Vincent J. O'Flaherty, *Renewal: Call and Response* (Jan and Mar 1973).
- 5/3 Pedro Arrupe, "Art and the Spirit of the Society of Jesus"; Clement J. McNaspy, "Art in Jesuit Life," in *The Place of Art in Jesuit Life* (Apr 1973).
- 5/4 John C. Haughey, *The Pentecostal Thing and Jesuits* (Jun 1973).
- 5/5 Ladislav Orsy, *Toward a Theological Evaluation of Communal Discernment* (Oct 1973).
- 6/1–6/2 John W. Padberg, *The General Congregations of the Society of Jesus: A Brief Survey of Their History* (Jan and Mar 1974).
- 6/3 David B. Knight, *Joy and Judgment in Religious Obedience* (Apr 1974).
- 6/4 Jules J. Toner, *The Deliberation That Started the Jesuits: A Commentario on the Deliberatio primorum Patrum, Newly Translated, with a Historical Introduction* (Jun 1974).
- 6/5 Robert L. Schmitt, *The Christ-Experience and Relationship Fostered in the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola* (Oct 1974).
- 7/1 John H. Wright, George E. Ganss, and Ladislav Orsy, *On Thinking with the Church Today* (Jan 1975).
- 7/2 George E. Ganss, *The Christian Life Communities as Sprung from the Sodalities of Our Lady*; Miss José Gsell and Sister Françoise Vandermeersch, *A Specimen Copy of Communications from the International Service in Ignatian Spirituality, Rome* (Mar 1975).

- 7/3 William J. Connolly, *Contemporary Spiritual Direction—Scope and Principles: An Introductory Essay* (Jun 1975).
- 7/4 Thomas E. Clarke, *Ignatian Spirituality and Societal Consciousness*; Ladislav Orsy, *Faith and Justice: Some Reflections* (Sep 1975).
- 7/5 Michael J. Buckley, *The Confirmation of a Promise: A Letter to George Ganss*; John W. Padberg, *Continuity and Change in General Congregation XXXII* (Nov 1975).
- 8/1 Charles E. O'Neill, *Acatamiento: Ignatian Reverence in History and in Contemporary Culture* (Jan 1976).
- 8/2–8/3 Horacio de la Costa, "A More Authentic Poverty"; Edward F. Sheridan, "The Decree on Poverty," in *On Becoming Poor: A Symposium on Evangelical Poverty*, with discussions by Michael J. Buckley, William J. Connolly, David L. Fleming, George E. Ganss, Robert F. Harvanek, Daniel F. X. Meenan, Charles E. O'Neill, and Ladislav Orsy (Mar and May 1976).
- 8/4 Robert L. Faricy, *Jesuit Community: Community of Prayer* (Oct 1976).
- 8/5 Michael J. Buckley, *Jesuit Priesthood: Its Meaning and Commitments* (Dec 1976).
- 9/1–9/2 Joseph M. Becker, "Section I: The Statistics and a Tentative Analysis"; Ladislav Orsy, Robert F. Harvanek, James J. Gill, David L. Fleming, and William J. Connolly, "Section II: Other Reactions and Explanations from Different Backgrounds," in *Changes in U.S. Jesuit Membership, 1958–1975: A Symposium* (Jan and Mar 1977).
- 9/3 Robert F. Harvanek, *The Reluctance to Admit Sin* (May 1977).
- 9/4 Bill Connolly, "A Letter on the Problematic, To Phil Land," and "A Reply to Phil Land: Afterthoughts"; Phil Land, "A Reply about the Problematic," in *Jesuit Spiritualities and the Struggle for Social Justice* (Sep 1977).
- 9/5 James J. Gill, *A Jesuit's Account of Conscience—For Personal and Organizational Effectiveness* (Nov 1977).
- 10/1 Alfred C. Kammer, "Burn-Out": *Contemporary Dilemma for the Jesuit Social Activist*; Richard L. Smith, Francisco Ornelas, and Noel Barré, *Other Viewpoints* (Jan 1978).
- 10/2–10/3 William A. Barry, Madeline Birmingham, William J. Connolly, Robert J. Fahey, Virginia Sullivan Finn, and James J. Gill, *Affectivity and Sexuality: Their Relationship to the Spiritual and Apostolic Life of Jesuits—Comments on Three Experiences* (Mar and May 1978).
- 10/4 Robert F. Harvanek, *The Status of Obedience in the Society of Jesus*; Philip S. Land, *Reactions to the Connolly-Land Letters on Faith and Justice: A Digest* (Sep 1978).
- 10/5 John W. Padberg, *Personal Experience and the Spiritual Exercises: The Example of Saint Ignatius* (Nov 1978).
- 11/1 Thomas H. Clancy, *Feeling Bad about Feeling Good* (Jan 1979).
- 11/2 Dominic Maruca, *Our Personal Witness as a Power toward Evangelizing Our Culture* (Mar 1979).
- 11/3 J. Leo Klein, *American Jesuits and the Liturgy* (May 1979).
- 11/4 Michael J. Buckley, *Mission in Companionship: Of Jesuit Community and Communion* (Sep 1979).
- 11/5 Joseph F. Conwell, *The Kamikaze Factor: Choosing Jesuit Ministries* (Nov 1979).
- 12/1 Thomas H. Clancy, ed., *Veteran Witnesses: Their Experience of Jesuit Life* [reflections of fifteen Jesuits] (Jan 1980).

- 12/2 Peter J. Henriot, Joseph A. Appleyard, and J. Leo Klein, *Living Together in Mission: A Symposium on Small Apostolic Communities* (Mar 1980).
- 12/3 Joseph F. Conwell, *Living and Dying in the Society of Jesus or Endeavoring to Imitate Angelic Purity* (May 1980).
- 12/4–12/5 J. Peter Schineller, *The Newer Approaches to Christology and Their Use in the Spiritual Exercises* (Sep and Nov 1980).
- 13/1 Simon Peter [pseudonym], *Alcoholism and Jesuit Life: An Individual and Community Illness* (Jan 1981).
- 13/2 Paul Begheyn, *A Bibliography on St. Ignatius' Spiritual Exercises: A Working Tool for American Students* (Mar 1981).
- 13/3 George E. Ganss, *Toward Understanding the Jesuit Brothers' Vocation, Especially as Described in the Papal and Jesuit Documents* (May 1981).
- 13/4 James W. Reites, *St. Ignatius of Loyola and the Jews* (Sep 1981).
- 13/5 David J. O'Brien, *The Jesuits and Catholic Higher Education* (Nov 1981).
- 14/1 John W. O'Malley, *The Jesuits, St. Ignatius, and the Counter Reformation: Some Recent Studies and Their Implications for Today* (Jan 1982).
- 14/2 Avery Dulles, *Saint Ignatius and the Jesuit Theological Tradition* (Mar 1982).
- 14/3 Paul V. Robb, *Conversion as a Human Experience* (May 1982).
- 14/4 Howard J. Gray, *An Experience in Ignatian Government: Letters to a New Rector* (Sep 1982).
- 14/5 Francisco Ivern, *The Future of Faith and Justice: A Critical Review of Decree Four* (Nov 1982).
- 15/1 John W. O'Malley, *The Fourth Vow in Its Ignatian Context: A Historical Study* (Jan 1983).
- 15/2 Francis A. Sullivan and Robert L. Faricy, *On Making the Spiritual Exercises for the Renewal of Jesuit Charisms* (Mar 1983).
- 15/3–15/4 John W. Padberg, *The Society True to Itself: A Brief History of the 32nd General Congregation of the Society of Jesus (December 2, 1974–March 7, 1975)* (May and Sep 1983).
- 15/5–16/1 Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Jesuits' Mission in Higher Education: Perspectives & Contexts* (Nov 1983 and Jan 1984).
- 16/2 John W. O'Malley, *To Travel to Any Part of the World: Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation* (Mar 1984).
- 16/3 Daniel J. O'Hanlon, *Integration of Christian Practices: A Western Christian Looks East* (May 1984).
- 16/4 Gregory I. Carlson, "A Faith Lived Out of Doors": *Ongoing Formation of Jesuits Today* (Sep 1984).
- 16/5 E. Edward Kinerk, *Eliciting Great Desires: Their place in the Spirituality of the Society of Jesus* (Nov 1984).
- 17/1 William C. Spohn, *St. Paul on Apostolic Celibacy and the Body of Christ* (Jan 1985).
- 17/2 Brian E. Daley, "In Ten Thousand Places": *Christian Universality and the Jesuit Mission* (Mar 1985).
- 17/3 Joseph A. Tetlow, *A Dialogue on the Sexual Maturing of Celibates* (May 1985).
- 17/4 William C. Spohn, John A. Coleman, Thomas E. Clarke, and Peter J. Henriot, *Jesuits and Peacemaking: A Symposium* (Sep 1985).
- 17/5 E. Edward Kinerk, *When Jesuits Pray: A Perspective on the Prayer of Apostolic Persons* (Nov 1985).
- 18/1 Donald L. Gelpi, *The Converting Jesuit* (Jan 1986).

- 18/2 Charles J. Beirne, *Compass and Catalyst: An Essay on the Ministry of Administration* (Mar 1986).
- 18/3 Richard A. McCormick, *Bishops as Teachers and Jesuits as Listeners* (May 1986).
- 18/4 Brian O. McDermott, *With Him, In Him: Graces of the Spiritual Exercises* (Sep 1986).
- 18/5 Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Transformation of Jesuit Poverty* (Nov 1986).
- 19/1 John M. Staudenmaier, *United States Technology and Adult Commitment* (Jan 1987).
- 19/2 J. A. Appleyard, *The Languages We Use: Talking about Religious Experience* (Mar 1987).
- 19/3 J. William Harmless and Donald L. Gelpi, *Priesthood Today and the Jesuit Vocation* (May 1987).
- 19/4 Roger Haight, *Foundational Issues in Jesuit Spirituality* (Sep 1987).
- 19/5 Philip Endean, *Who Do You Say Ignatius Is? Jesuit Fundamentalism and Beyond* (Nov 1987).
- 20/1 Dean Brackley, *Downward Mobility: Social Implications of St Ignatius's Two Standards* (Jan 1988).
- 20/2 John W. Padberg, *How We Live Where We Live* (Mar 1988).
- 20/3 James M. Hayes, John W. Padberg, and John M. Staudenmaier, *Symbols, Devotions, and Jesuits* (May 1988).
- 20/4 Arthur F. McGovern, *Jesuit Education and Jesuit Spirituality* (Sep 1988).
- 20/5 William A. Barry, *Jesuit Formation Today: An Invitation to Dialogue and Involvement* (Nov 1988).
- 21/1 George B. Wilson, *Where Do We Belong? United States Jesuits and Their Memberships* (Jan 1989).
- 21/2 Adrien Demoustier, "The First Companions and the Poor"; Jean-Yves Calvez, "The Preferential Option for the Poor: Where Does It Come From For Us?", in *The Disturbing Subject: The Option for the Poor*, trans. Edward F. Sheridan; includes short reflections by Dan Weber, James K. Voiss, Michael L. Cook, Jack Morris, James E. Royce, Phil Borroughs, J. D. Whitney, Kevin Connell, and Chuck Schmitz (Mar 1989).
- 21/3 Paul A. Soukup, *Jesuit Response to the Communication Revolution* (May 1989).
- 21/4 Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Fundamentum: Creation in the Principle and Foundation* (Sep 1989).
- 21/5 Past and Present Seminar Members, *Jesuits Praying: Personal Reflections* (Nov 1989).
- 22/1 L. Patrick Carroll, *The Spiritual Exercises in Everyday Life: A Practical Implementation* (Jan 1990).
- 22/2 Joseph A. Bracken, *Jesuit Spirituality from a Process Prospective* (Mar 1990).
- 22/3 John R. Shepherd with Paul A. Soukup, *Fire for a Weekend: An Experience of the Spiritual Exercises* (May 1990).
- 22/4 Michael J. O'Sullivan, *Trust Your Feelings, but Use Your Head: Discernment and the Psychology of Decision Making* (Sep 1990).
- 22/5 John A. Coleman, *A Company of Critics: Jesuits and the Intellectual Life* (Nov 1990).
- 23/1 Frank J. Houdek, *The Road Too Often Traveled: Formation—"Developing the Apostolic Body of the Society"* (Jan 1991).
- 23/2 James J. DiGiacomo, *Ministering to the Young* (Mar 1991).

- 23/3 Paul Begheyn and Kenneth Bogart, *A Bibliography on St. Ignatius's Spiritual Exercises* (May 1991).
- 23/4 Charles M. Shelton, *Reflections on the Mental Health of Jesuits* (Sep 1991).
- 23/5 David S. Toolan, "Nature Is a Heraclitean Fire": *Reflections on Cosmology in an Ecological Age* (Nov 1991).
- 24/1 Frank J. Houdek, *Jesuit Prayer and Jesuit Ministry: Context and Possibilities* (Jan 1992).
- 24/2 Thomas H. Smolich, *Testing the Water: Jesuits Accompanying the Poor* (Mar 1992).
- 24/3 David J. Hassel, *Jesus Christ Changing Yesterday, Today, and Forever* (May 1992).
- 24/4 Charles M. Shelton, *Toward Healthy Jesuit Community Living: Some Psychological Reflections* (Sep 1992).
- 24/5 Michael L. Cook, *Jesus' Parables and the Faith That Does Justice* (Nov 1992).
- 25/1 Thomas H. Clancy, *Saint Ignatius as Fund-Raiser* (Jan 1993).
- 25/2 John R. Donahue, *What Does the Lord Require?: A Bibliographical Essay on the Bible and Social Justice* (Mar 1993).
- 25/3 John W. Padberg, *Ignatius, the Popes, and Realistic Reverence* (May 1993).
- 25/4 Thomas H. Stahel, *Toward General Congregation 34: A History "from Below" of GC 31, GC 32, and GC 33* (Sep 1993).
- 25/5 John F. Baldovin, *Christian Liturgy: An Annotated Bibliography for Jesuits* (Nov 1993).
- 26/1 Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Most Postmodern Prayer: American Jesuit Identity and the Examen of Conscience, 1920–1990* (Jan 1994).
- 26/2 Séamus Murphy, *The Many Ways of Justice* (Mar 1994).
- 26/3 John M. Staudenmaier, *To Fall in Love with the World: Individualism and Self-Transcendence in American Life* (May 1994).
- 26/4 John B. Foley, *Stepping into the River: Reflections on the Vows* (Sep 1994).
- 26/5 Thomas M. Landy, *Myths That Shape Us: Jesuit Beliefs about the Value of Institutions* (Nov 1994).
- 27/1 Brian E. Daley, "To Be More like Christ": *The Background and Implications of "Three Kinds of Humility"* (Jan 1995).
- 27/2 Edward W. Schmidt, *Portraits and Landscapes: Scenes from Our Common Life* (Mar 1995).
- 27/3 Gerard L. Stockhausen, "I'd Love to, but I Don't Have the Time": *Jesuits and Leisure* (May 1995).
- 27/4 George M. Anderson, *Jesuits in Jail, Ignatius to the Present* (Sep 1995).
- 27/5 Charles M. Shelton, *Friendship in Jesuit Life: The Joys, the Struggles, the Possibilities* (Nov 1995).
- 28/1 Paul Begheyn, *Bibliography on the History of the Jesuits: Publications in English, 1900–1993* (Jan 1996).
- 28/2 Joseph Veale, *Saint Ignatius Speaks about "Ignatian Prayer"* (Mar 1996).
- 28/3 Francis X. Clooney, *In Ten Thousand Places, in Every Blade of Grass: Uneventful but True Confessions about Finding God in India, and Here Too* (May 1996).
- 28/4 Carl F. Starkloff, *As Different as Night and Day: Ignatius's Presupposition and Our Way of Conversing across Cultures* (Sep 1996).
- 28/5 Edward F. Beckett, *Listening to Our History: Inculturation and Jesuit Slaveholding* (Nov 1996).

- 29/1 Dennis Hamm, *Preaching Biblical Justice: To Nurture the Faith That Does It* (Jan 1997).
- 29/2 John W. Padberg, *The Three Forgotten Founders of the Society of Jesus: Paschase Broët (1500–1652), Jean Codure (1508–1541), Claude Jay (1504–1552)* (Mar 1997).
- 29/3 Peter D. Byrne, *Jesuits and Parish Ministry* (May 1997).
- 29/4 James F. Keenan, *Are Informationes Ethical?* (Sep 1997).
- 29/5 Ernest C. Ferlita, *The Road to Bethlehem—Is it Level or Winding?: The Use of the Imagination in the Spiritual Exercises* (Nov 1997).
- 30/1 Paul Shore, *The “Vita Christi” of Ludolph of Saxony and Its Influence on the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola* (Jan 1998).
- 30/2 Carl F. Starkloff, *“I’m No Theologian, but . . . (or so . . .)?”: The Role of Theology in the Life and Ministry of Jesuits* (Mar 1998).
- 30/3 James S. Torrens, *The Word That Clamors: Jesuit Poetry That Reflects the Spiritual Exercises* (May 1998).
- 30/4 Clement J. Petrik, *Being Sent: A Personal Reflection on Jesuit Governance in Changing Times* (Sep 1998).
- 30/5 Charles J. Jackson, *One and the Same Vocation: The Jesuit Brother, 1957 to the Present—A Critical Analysis* (Nov 1998).
- 31/1 Richard J. Clifford, *Scripture and the Exercises: Moving from the Gospels and Psalms to Exodus and Proverbs* (Jan 1999).
- 31/2 Timothy E. Toohig, *Physics Research: A Search for God* (Mar 1999).
- 31/3 Gerald M. Fagin, *Fidelity in the Church—Then and Now* (May 1999).
- 31/4 J. Peter Schineller, *The Pilgrim Journey of Ignatius: From Soldier to Laborer in the Lord’s Vineyard and Its Implications for Apostolic Lay Spirituality* (Sep 1999).
- 31/5 Lisa Fullam, *Juana, SJ: The Past (and Future) Status of Women in the Society of Jesus* (Nov 1999).
- 32/1 John P. Langan, *The Good of Obedience in a Culture of Autonomy* (Jan 2000).
- 32/2 Richard A. Blake, *Listen with Your Eyes: Interpreting Images in the Spiritual Exercises* (Mar 2000) [misnumbered on the front cover as “31/2.”].
- 32/3 Charles M. Shelton, *When a Jesuit Counsels Others: Some Practical Guidelines* (May 2000).
- 32/4 William A. Barry, *Past, Present, and Future: A Jubilarian’s Reflections on Jesuit Spirituality* (Sep 2000).
- 32/5 Carl F. Starkloff, *Pilgrimage Re-envisioned: Mission and Culture in the Last Five General Congregations* (Nov 2000).
- 33/1 Peter-Hans Kolvenbach, “The Service of Faith and the Promotion of Justice in American Jesuit Higher Education,” in *Faith, Justice, and American Jesuit Higher Education: Readings from the Formula of the Institute, the Constitutions, the Complementary Norms, GC 32, Pedro Arrupe, and GC 34*; and an address by Peter-Hans Kolvenbach (Jan 2001).
- 33/2 James F. Keenan, *Unexpected Consequences: A Jesuit and Puritan Book, Robert Persons’s Christian Directory, and Its Relevance for Jesuit Spirituality Today* (Mar 2001).
- 33/3 Pedro Arrupe, *The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism* (May 2001).
- 33/4 Joseph Veale, *Saint Ignatius Asks, “Are You Sure You Know Who I Am?”* (Sep 2001).

- 33/5 William A. Barry and James F. Keenan, eds., *How Multicultural Are We? Six Stories*, by Claudio M. Burgaleta, Gregory C. Chisholm, Eduardo C. Fernandez, Gerdenio M. Manuel, J-Glenn Murray, and Hung T. Pham (Nov 2001).
- 34/1 Richard A. Blake, *City of the Living God: The Urban Roots of the Spiritual Exercises* (Jan 2002).
- 34/2 Francis X. Clooney, *A Charism for Dialogue: Advice from the Early Jesuit Missionaries in Our World of Religious Pluralism* (Mar 2002).
- 34/3 William Rehg, *Christian Mindfulness: A Path to Finding God in All Things* (May 2002).
- 34/4 Dean Brackley, *Expanding the Shrunken Soul: False Humility, Ressentiment, and Magnanimity* (Sep 2002).
- 34/5 Robert Bireley, *The Jesuits and Politics in Time of War: A Self-Appraisal* (Nov 2002).
- 35/1 William A. Barry, *Jesuit Spirituality for the Whole of Life* (Jan 2003).
- 35/2 V. Rev. John Baptist Janssens, *Instruction and Ordinance Concerning the Training of Ours in the Sacred Liturgy*, with introduction by Lawrence J. Madden (Mar 2003).
- 35/3 Douglas Marcouiller, *Archbishop with an Attitude: Oscar Romero's Sentir con la Iglesia* (May 2003).
- 35/4 Ronald Modras, *A Jesuit in the Crucible: Friedrich Spee and the Witchcraft Hysteria in Seventeenth-Century Germany* (Sep 2003).
- 35/5 Thomas M. Lucas, *Virtual Vessels, Mystical Signs: Contemplating Mary's Images in the Jesuit Tradition* (Nov 2003).
- 36/1 Thomas P. Rausch, *Christian Life Communities for Jesuit University Students?* (Spring 2004).
- 36/2 James Bernauer, *The Holocaust and the Search for Forgiveness: An Invitation to the Society of Jesus?* (Summer 2004).
- 36/3 David E. Nantais, "Whatever!" Is Not Ignatian Indifference: *Jesuits and the Ministry to Young Adults* (Fall 2004).
- 36/4 János Lukács, *The Incarnational Dynamic of the Constitutions* (Winter 2004).
- 37/1 Dennis C. Smolarski, *Jesuits on the Moon: Seeking God in All Things . . . Even Mathematics!* (Spring 2005).
- 37/2 Peter McDonough, *Clenched Fist or Open Hands? Five Jesuit Perspectives on Pluralism* (Summer 2005).
- 37/3 James S. Torrens, *Tuskegee Years: What Father Arrupe Got Me Into* (Fall 2005).
- 37/4 Kevin O'Brien, *Consolation in Action: The Jesuit Refugee Service and the Ministry of Accompaniment* (Winter 2005).
- 38/1 Peter Schineller, *In Their Own Words: Ignatius, Xavier, Favre and Our Way of Proceeding* (Spring 2006).
- 38/2 Charles J. Jackson, *Something That Happened to Me at Manresa: The Mystical Origin of the Ignatian Charism* (Summer 2006).
- 38/3 William Reiser, *Locating the Grace of the Fourth Week: A Theological Inquiry* (Fall 2006).
- 38/4 John W. O'Malley, *Five Missions of the Jesuit Charism: Content and Method* (Winter 2006).
- 39/1 Gerald L. McKevitt, *Italian Jesuits in Maryland: A Clash of Theological Cultures* (Spring 2007).

- 39/2 Patrick M. Kelly, *Loved into Freedom and Service: Lay Experiences of the Exercises in Daily Life* (Summer 2007).
- 39/3 T. Frank Kennedy, *Music and the Jesuit Mission in the New World* (Autumn 2007).
- 39/4 William E. Creed, *Jesuits and the Homeless: Companions on Life's Journey* (Winter 2007).
- 40/1 Luce Giard, *The Jesuit College: A Center for Knowledge, Art and Faith 1548–1773* (Spring 2008).
- 40/2 Wilkie Au, *Ignatian Service: Gratitude and Love in Action* (Summer 2008).
- 40/3 Robert J. Kaslyn, *The Jesuit Ministry of Publishing: Overview of Guidelines and Praxis* (Autumn 2008).
- 40/4 William Reh, *The Value and Viability of the Jesuit Brothers' Vocation: An American Perspective* (Winter 2008).
- 41/1 Markus Friedrich, *Governance in the Society of Jesus, 1540–1773: Its Methods, Critics, and Legacy Today* (Spring 2009).
- 41/2 Gerdenio Sonny Manuel, *Living Chastity: Psychosexual Well-Being in Jesuit Life* (Summer 2009).
- 41/3 Jeremy Clarke, *Our Lady of China: Marian Devotion and the Jesuits* (Autumn 2009).
- 41/4 Francis X. Hezel, *A Life at the Edge of the World* (Winter 2009).
- 42/1 Michael C. McCarthy, Thomas Massaro, Thomas Worcester, and Michael A. Zampelli, *Four Stories of the Kolvenbach Generation* (Spring 2010).
- 42/2 Roger Haight, *Expanding the Spiritual Exercises* (Summer 2010).
- 42/3 Thomas M. Cohen, *Jesuits and New Christians: The Contested Legacy of St. Ignatius* (Autumn 2010).
- 42/4 R. Bentley Anderson, Numa J. Rousseve Jr.: *Creole, Catholic, and Jesuit* (Winter 2010).
- 43/1 Milton Walsh, "To Always Be Thinking Somehow about Jesus": *The Prologue of Ludolph's Vita Christi* (Spring 2011).
- 43/2 Michael C. McCarthy, "Let Me Love More Passionately": *Religious Celibacy in a Secular Age* (Summer 2011).
- 43/3 Gerald L. McKeivitt, *The Gifts of Aging: Jesuit Elders in Their Own Words* (Autumn 2011).
- 43/4 John Gavin, "True Charity Begins Where Justice Ends": *The Life and Teachings of St. Alberto Hurtado* (Winter 2011).
- 44/1 Michael D. Barber, *Desolation and the Struggle for Justice* (Spring 2012).
- 44/2 Barton T. Geger, *The First First Companions: The Continuing Impact of the Men Who Left Ignatius* (Summer 2012).
- 44/3 Emanuele Colombo, "Even among Turks": *Tirso González de Santalla (1624–1705) and Islam* (Autumn 2012).
- 44/4 Thomas D. Stegman, "Run That You May Obtain the Prize": *Using St. Paul as a Resource for the Spiritual Exercises* (Winter 2012).
- 45/1 Hilmar M. Pabel, *Fear and Consolation: Peter Canisius and the Spirituality of Dying and Death* (Spring 2013).
- 45/2 Robert E. Scully, *The Suppression of the Society of Jesus: A Perfect Storm in the Age of the "Enlightenment"* (Summer 2013).
- 45/3 Jorge Mario Bergoglio, *Writings on Jesuit Spirituality I*, trans. Philip Endean (Autumn 2013).
- 45/4 Jorge Mario Bergoglio, *Writings on Jesuit Spirituality II*, trans. Philip Endean (Winter 2013).

- 46/1 Anthony J. Kuzniewski, *"Our American Champions": The First American Generation of American Jesuit Leaders after the Restoration of the Society* (Spring 2014).
- 46/2 Hung T. Pham, *Composing a Sacred Space: A Lesson from the Catechismus of Alexandre de Rhodes* (Summer 2014).
- 46/3 Barton T. Geger, *Hidden Theology in the "Autobiography" of St. Ignatius* (Autumn 2014).
- 46/4 Nicholas Austin, *Mind and Heart: Towards an Ignatian Spirituality of Study* (Winter 2014).
- 47/1 John W. O'Malley, *Jesuit Schools and the Humanities Yesterday and Today* (Spring 2015).
- 47/2 Paul [L.] Mariani, *The Mystery and the Majesty of It: Jesuit Spirituality in the Poetry of Gerald Manley Hopkins* (Summer 2015).
- 47/3 Mark Lewis, *Unfinished Business: The Spiritual Coadjutor in the Society of Jesus Today* (Autumn 2015).
- 47/4 Francis X. Hezel, *Let the Spirit Speak: Learning to Pray* (Winter 2015).
- 48/1 Joseph A. Tetlow, *The Preached Weekend Retreat: A Relic or a Future?* (Spring 2016).
- 48/2 Hung T. Pham and Eduardo C. Fernández, *Pilgrims in Community at the Frontiers: A Contemplation on Jesuit Mission Today* (Summer 2016).
- 48/3 E. Edward Kinerk, *Personal Encounters with Jesus Christ* (Autumn 2016).
- 48/4 Barton T. Geger, *Bending the Knee to Baal? St. Ignatius on Jesuit Vocation Promotion* (Winter 2016).
- 49/1 William C. Woody, *"So We Are Ambassadors for Christ": The Jesuit Ministry of Reconciliation* (Spring 2017).
- 49/2 Henry J. Shea, *The Beloved Disciple and the Spiritual Exercises* (Summer 2017).
- 49/3 Members of General Congregation 36, *The Moment of GC 36 for Its Members* (Autumn 2017).
- 49/4 Richard J. Baumann, *Our Jesuit Constitutions: Cooperation as Union* (Winter 2017).
- 50/1 Barton T. Geger, *Ten Things That St. Ignatius Never Said or Did* (Spring 2018).
- 50/2 Ted Penton, *Spiritual Care for the Poor: An Ignatian Response to Pope Francis's Challenge* (Summer 2018).
- 50/3 William McCormick, *"A Continual Sacrifice to the Glory of God": Ignatian Magnanimity as Cooperation with the Divine* (Autumn 2018).
- 50/4 Brian O. McDermott, *Spiritual Consolation and Its Role in the Second Time of Election* (Winter 2018).
- 51/1 James J. Conn, *Jesuits and Eucharistic Concelebration*; John F. Baldovin, *Jesuits, the Ministerial Priesthood, and Eucharistic Concelebration* (Spring 2019).
- 51/2 John W. O'Malley, *How We Were: Life in a Jesuit Novitiate, 1946–1948* (Summer 2019).
- 51/3 János Lukács, *To Be Changed as Deeply as We Would Hope: Revisiting the Novitiate* (Autumn 2019).
- 51/4 Elisa Frei, PhD, *Signed in Blood: Negotiating with Superiors General about the Overseas Missions* (Winter 2019).
- 52/1 Aaron D. Pidel, *Jerome Nadal's Apology for the Spiritual Exercises: A Study in Balanced Spirituality* (Spring 2020).

- 52/2 Philip R. Amidon, *Papal Documents from the Early Years of the Society of Jesus in English Translation* (Summer 2020).
- 52/3 John W. O'Malley and Timothy W. O'Brien, *The Twentieth-Century Construction of Ignatian Spirituality: A Sketch* (Autumn 2020).
- 52/4 Sam Z. Conedera, *Forgotten Saint: The Life and Writings of Alfonso Salmerón, SJ* (Winter 2020).
- 53/1 Kevin P. Quinn, *Is a Different Kind of Jesuit University Possible Today? The Legacy of Ignacio Ellacuría, SJ* (Spring 2021).
- 53/2 Charles T. Barnes, *To Stand before the Cross and Not Run Away: A Practical Guide to Directing the Spiritual Exercises for Retreatants with Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder and Moral Injury* (Summer 2021).
- 53/3 Emily A. Ransom, *St. Ignatius in the Affective School of Ludolph of Saxony* (Autumn 2021).
- 53/4 *The Primitive Constitutions of 1541 and Other Preparatory Documents for the Jesuit Constitutions*, trans. Joseph A. Munitiz (Winter 2021).
- 54/1 William R. O'Neill, *The "Jesuit" in Jesuit Refugee Service* (Spring 2022).
- 54/2 Thomas J. Flowers, *Peter Canisius and the Future of Christian Catechesis* (Summer 2022).
- 54/3 *Jerónimo Nadal's Commentary on the General Examen*, trans. Joshua D. Hinchie (Autumn 2022).
- 54/4 Gregory C. Chisholm, William D. Critchley-Menor, Timothy P. Kesicki, *Day of Reckoning: Essays on Racism and Slaveholding in the Society of Jesus* (Winter 2022).
- 55/1 Henry J. Shea, *Contemplatives and Apostles: The Paradoxical Harmony of the Carthusian and Jesuit Charisms* (Spring 2023).
- 55/2 William McCormick, ed., *Le Style, C'est L'Homme: Remembering John W. O'Malley, SJ (1927–2022)* (Summer 2023).
- 55/3 Susan K. Wood, SCL, *Francis's Church Reform Focused on the Proclamation of Mercy: The Ignatian Influence* (Autumn 2023).
- 55/4 Gerald O'Collins and Manfred Cain, eds., *Poetry for Prayer: Gospel Stories as Read by Peter Steele, SJ* (Winter 2023).
- 56/1 Christopher M. Staab, "Always Growing in Devotion": *The Grace of Devotion in the Life of Ignatius of Loyola and the Society of Jesus* (Spring 2024).
- 56/2 E. Edward Kinerk and Joseph A. Tetlow, *Orat pro Eccl. et Soc.: Reflections on an Essential Mission* (Summer 2024).
- 56/3 Thomas J. Flowers, "Great in the Love of God": *The Preaching of Diego Laínez* (Autumn 2024).
- 56/4 Jean-Marc Laporte, "French and English Jesuits in Canada: Two Solitudes?" (Winter 2024).
- 57/1 James P. Croghan, Thomas M. McCoog, William T. Oulvey, Josef Raoul P. Rodriguez, Thomas H. Smolich, *How We Were: Life in a Jesuit Novitiate, 1971–2018* (Spring 2025).
- 57/2 J. Peter Bisson, David Hollenbach, Alfred A. Kammer, Brian A. Strasburger, Martin R. Tripole, *Fifty Years of Lived Experience: Reflections on Decree 4 of the 32nd General Congregation of the Society of Jesus* (Autumn 2025).
- 57/3 Matthew Cortese, *Holy Words: Praying the Liturgy of the Hours with St. Peter Faber* (Winter 2025).
- 58/1 Jos Moons, *Ignatius of Loyola and the Holy Spirit: Four Strategies to Cope with the Pneumatological Ambiguity of Early Ignatian Sources* (Spring 2026).

Publication Information

The contact information for the business office is as follows:

Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits Institute for Advanced Jesuit Studies 140 Commonwealth Avenue Chestnut Hill, MA 02467	Office: 617-552-9097 Fax: 617-552-0811 Administrator: Anuska Lisec Gras Email: anuska.lisecgras@bc.edu
---	--

Since October 2025, the Institute for Advanced Jesuit Studies provides a free online subscription to all Jesuits of the Conference of Canada and United States.

All communities of the Jesuit Conference of Canada and the United States will receive, each summer, a single bound edition of all issues from the previous year for their libraries. Please do not contact the Institute about changes of address; the Jesuit Conference regularly updates the Institute on these changes. If Jesuit communities are not receiving editions, they should contact their respective provinces to ensure that the latter have their correct addresses.

Back Issues

A complete archive of previous issues is accessible online through the Institute of Jesuit Sources: <https://jesuitsourcesdigital.bc.edu/periodicals/ssj/>

“Letters to the Editor,” and all other questions or comments regarding the content of STUDIES or the submission of essays, should be sent to the general editor at:

Fr. Michael L. Knox, SJ, General Editor Institute for Advanced Jesuit Studies 140 Commonwealth Avenue Chestnut Hill, MA 02467	Office: 617-552-9097 Fax: 617-552-0811 E-mail: JCCUStudies@jesuits.org
--	---